

Implementation of Character Education: Case Study of Citizenship Education Subject at Junior High School in Paul, Indonesia

By Gusnarib Gusnarib

Implementation of Character Education: Case Study of Citizenship Education Subject at Junior High School in Paul, Indonesia

Gusnarib¹, Ardi², Darman Manda³, Suradi Tahmir⁴

^{1,2,3,4} Education Department, Universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: Gusnarib

Abstract : This study discusses the implementation of character education in junior high school or SMP Negeri 5 Tavanjuka Palu carried out by citizenship education teachers. The objective of this research is to reveal the positive things related to the development of cultural values in citizenship education learning. The proposed problem is how the citizenship education teachers in SMP 5 Tavanjuka Palu implement character education. This research was a case study in a field related to citizenship education learning in the classroom containing character education. It was conducted through interviews with principals, citizenship education teachers, and traditional leaders of Kaili in Palu. After the data had been collected, the data were then analyzed through reducing, displaying, verifying, and concluding. The results show that character education in SMP Negeri 5 Tavanjuka Palu has not implemented well and there are some main problems. First, there is no clear curriculum guide. There is a solid time for the student in learning each day. A special institution which focuses on instilling the standard of the determined character has not been available. Citizenship education learning contains character values which are reflected in the story of the characters and people who inspire teenagers so that they deserve to be imitated by teenagers or students. Students of SMP Negeri 5 Tavanjuka Palu, psychologically require internalization of the character values especially religious, honesty, discipline, hard work, creative, independent, caring, and responsibility through learning the story or cultural habits.

Keywords: Character values, Citizenship education, curriculum, cultural habit

Date of Submission: 17-03-2018

Date of acceptance: 02-03-2018

I. Introduction

Education is essentially a conscious effort to develop the potential of human resources and the empowerment of learners by encouraging and facilitating learning activities, instilling the values of life to them. It is in accordance with the Indonesian regulation No. 20 in 2003 on National Education System Chapter 1 Article 1. It is stated education is a conscious and deliberate effort to create an atmosphere of learning and the learning process so that learners are actively developing their potential to have the spiritual power of religion, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble character, and skills required by society and the state. To achieve this goal, professional educators, ranging from primary education to higher education are required.

Based on this regulation, educational activities must arise from a sense of awareness and responsibility of each individual as well, and they have to take place without pressure from others. In addition, education is a vital and inherent need for everyone to improve the quality of human resources. The legislation of the national education system also suggests that educational programs should be planned. The plan includes curriculum, teaching, infrastructure, and various aspects which can support the implementation of the education process so that it can provide a description of how the educational process takes place and how the expected results are achieved. Thus, planning of education process should involve various stakeholders, including teachers, principals, school committees, staff, and other parties concerned.

Every teacher should understand that the whole process and the task of a good teaching program can give great support to the students in completing their development tasks. In relation to the development of the learners particularly those related to childhood and adolescent sitting in primary and secondary schools, at this time students require internalization of the values of life to cultivate a unified identity and integrity. Henson and Eller (1999) revealed that an effective teacher would always think to look for a better way of teaching. The effective teacher will stop thinking then do eye contact to calm the class. They will perform proximity control which is described by walking the noisiest part of the class and continue to be there until the commotion is low.

II. Research Methods

The method is in understanding how objects being targeted research. Researchers can choose one of a variety of methods in accordance with the objectives, nature, objects, nature science or theory that supports it. In the study, the object determines the method to be used. (Koentjaraningrat, 1977, p.7-8). Sukmadinata (2010, p.60) states that qualitative research is research which describes and analyzes phenomena, events, social activities, attitudes, beliefs, perceptions, thoughts of people individually or in groups. This study aims at describing the data by using words or phrases that are distinguished by elements or specific parts to derive conclusions. In addition, Frankel and Wallen (2007, p.66) states that qualitative research is research which requires researchers to examine the naturally occurring phenomenon in all its complexity. Researchers explore internal conditions of actor used to capture the meaning of the behavior Based on this research goal (Bogdad and Biklen, 192).

The instrument of this research was the researchers themselves. According to Sugiyono (2010: 305), in qualitative research, the instrument is the researchers themselves. The position of the researchers in qualitative research is a human instrument who serve to establish the focus of research, select informants as a source of data, collect data, analyze data, interpret the data and make conclusions on the findings. Denzim and Lincoln (1994) state that to understand the views of each of the individual, then in-depth interviews in this study serve to get information on each individual. These two things are conducted directly by the researchers themselves against informants. To support the results of in-depth interviews, the researchers also conducted interviews with two other teachers with the same subject as a comparative data. The interviews with the one school supervisor, three students, and one parent are conducted to support the data.

III. Literature Review

The function of education in this period began to lose as processes that lead learners to be fully human. The human can portray himself as the problem solver for themselves and others. This fact can be seen from the paradigm shift in community values, truth, happiness, and justice. Human life is increasingly individualistic and consumerism, as reflected in the behavior of corruption, environmental destruction, injustice law, rape, violence and unrest, anarchy, social conflict and violence in the name of religion or other forms, the use of the narrative of bad language, and moral decadence.

The worst thing is that character of the nation, moral principles, and cultural values of the nation are no longer becoming the guide for life. This condition makes the character of the nation, the internalization of character education in the family, community, and educational institutions have been weakened so that they should be affirmed through learning and transferring character values and moral values at school, family and society. Global developments make the pattern of life is slowly affected, including economic development, communications, and information technology. They have been accelerating the transformation of the pattern of community life. Negative values of globalization continue to affect the identity and integrity of the nation, while on the other hand, the availability of human resources which have good character becomes a vital necessity. As a preventive solution, education is expected to improve the quality of the nation's youth in various aspects that can minimize and reduce the causes of the problems of culture and nation character. According to the Josephson Institute (2012: 1) refer to aspects of the term pillar is defined as the six pillars of Character are ethical values to guide our child ethics. The value standards of conduct that arise out of reviews those values constitute the ground rules of ethics, and therefore of ethical decision-making.

According to the Research and Development of Ministry of National Curriculum Center (2010), the character is defined as temperament, or personality which is formed from the internalization of the various virtues which are believed and used as the basis for perspective, thinking, referring to the concept of values and norms (value). Therefore, the concept of value is reaffirmed by Ravenj (1977). Social values are set of the considered attitude of society as a truth and are become the standard for people to achieve democratic and harmonious life. It means that the social values are a set of individuals who appreciated the gesture as a standard of truth and serve to behave in order to obtain the life of a democratic society and harmonious.

Then, the character and use of the term in a variety of fields, including education, are started from a popular concept raised by Aristotle that is *nicomacheans ethics* and *Socrates*. Larry Nucci (1989) affirmed the scholarly debate on moral development when the terminology of character education was introduced since the 1900s. Thomas Lickona was regarded as his supporter, especially when he wrote a book entitled *Educating for Character: How Our School Can Teach Respect and Responsibility* (1991) which was followed by writings such as *Return of Character Education*, published in the *Educational Leadership Journal* (November 1993) and the article entitled *Eleven Principles of Effective Character Education*, which was published in the *Journal of Moral Education* Volume 25 (1996).

Character education, according to him, contains three main elements, namely knowing the good, desiring the good, and doing the good (Lickona, 1991, p.51). On the other hand, Frye (2002, p.2) defines character education as a national movement creating schools that foster ethical, responsible, and caring young

people by modeling and teaching good character through an emphasis on universal values that we all share. Therefore, character education should bring learners to the introduction to value cognitively, appreciation of the value affectively, and experience of real value. It is the character education plans (moral) which is called moral knowing, moral feeling, and moral education by Thomas Lickona. Citizenship education is also a subject which becomes a part of the strengthening of the four (4) pillars of nationalities including Pancasila, the Constitution of 1945, national unity, and the Homeland. These four pillars are interlinked between one another, and Pancasila inspires all of the pillars.

In line with the opinion of Williams, Sriamin in Sudarsono (2010, p.104) states that the formation of the character needs to be realized because the character is the foundation that directs the behavior, which starts from the beginning and continuing throughout a person's life. It means that the characters cannot be processed by handing in a short time or suddenly during adulthood. However, it can be stated that the characters grow and develop in one's life consisting of several dimensions, and the formation of character is a synthesis of affect, behavior, and cognition of individuals. The dimensions are social sensitivity, nurturance and care, cooperation, helping others, moral choices, self-monitoring, and the social problem-solving. Social sensitivity is not just caring, but also reaching out and involving, not only caring but also solving. Therefore, it can be stated that it is more than just care. It is about how sympathy and empathy are developed. Nurturance and care are protecting, preserving, and maintaining relationships with others. Cooperation is the dimension of the character that needs to be developed. Helping others is how a character that can help others is developed. Honesty is also part of a person's character. Moral choices are that someone knows of how others respond. If the response is fun, then it should be done, should be run by it. Self-monitoring is how to control themselves, how to monitor yourself without having someone else doing for that. Social problem solving is the ability to resolve the social problems that occur and resolve the conflict.

The adolescent developmental period is a period of development towards autonomy (independence), or personal independence to achieve the developmental aspects. According to Yusuf and Nurihsan (2005: 187) adolescents should be able to accomplish the tasks of development, namely (1) receiving physical condition and utilizing it effectively; (2) achieving emotional independence from economic independence; (3) reaching guarantee economic independence; (4) selecting and preparing a job; (5) preparing for marriage and family life; and (6) developing concepts and intellectual skills which are necessary for competence as citizens. Emile Durkheim, (in Megawangi, 2009) state that society must have before it an ideal toward the which it Reaches it must have some good to Achieve, an original contribution to bringing to humankind. When the individual activity does not know where to a take hold, it turns against itself. When the moral sense and are used up in a morbid and harmful manner, society must have an ideal goal toward the goal which will be achieved. Society must have the glory, to achieve, an original contribution to humanity

Mubarok, (2008, p.3) affirm that education is a process of human development by knowing wisdom, knowledge, and ethics. Therefore, building aspects of cognitive, affective and psychomotor in balanced are the value of the highest educational attainment because contributions are made and at the same educational value can be used as neutralizing forms of inequality gap (conflict) that occur in some educational institutions from primary education to higher education.

In addition to the types of conflict that shows conflicts that commonly take place in a variety of social systems, Dugan and Maftuh, (2008, p.16) also outlines four types of conflict faced by pupil or student, namely controversy, conceptual, interests, and development conflict. Conflicts in encountered by the students usually occur in some conditions. The first is when the idea or opinion of someone is not in line with the ideas and opinions of others and both are trying to reach an agreement. The second is when different ideas are constantly in one's mind or when the information received does not correspond to a known person.

The third is when a person interested in something is trying to prevent or impede a person to achieve the interests or benefits. The fourth is when a child is in the process of searching for an identity. In addition, there is an opinion that cultural conflicts occur because of differences in national origin or ethnicity. Bodine & Crawford (1998, p.4) states that social conflicts occur due to differences in gender, sexual orientation, class, and physical and mental abilities. Private and institutional treatment of differences often leads to prejudice, discrimination, harassment, and even other crimes. Based on the above description, it can be concluded that there are various sources of conflict. In general, it can be concluded that the source of conflict is dissent and social inequality. According to Schopenhaur (in Megawangi; 2009) whoever is filled with compassion will assuredly injure no one, do harm always to respect anyone, forgive all the best, and no one, encroaches on man's rights, he can, and all of Hiss action will bear the stamp of justice and loving kindness.

Similarly, according to Cohen (1995), conflict is not just a normal part of life, it is also a necessary part. Conflict becomes a part which particularly plays a significant role in human psychological development. The conflict which we experience in life shape our character, our culture, and our world. However, the conflict is not always positive. At the emotional level, people may feel unhappy, angry, and depressed as a result of the conflict. From the above it can be concluded that conflict is normal and part of life which cannot be denied.

IV. Result and Discussion

RESULT

1.1. Analysis of Integration of Character Education on citizenship education subjects through learning and socialization

This research was conducted in SMP Negeri 5 Tavanjuka in which research subjects consist of 4 key informants (2 citizenship education teachers and two leaders), and three supporting informants. Data analysis is the result of triangulation of interviews and documents observations regarding the integration of character education conducted by citizenship education teachers as shown in the following table

Table 1. Recapitulation of Research finding about the integration of Character Education in teaching citizenship education at SMP 5 Tavanjuka

No	Indicators	The number of learning group	Percentage (%)
1	The planning of the integration of character education in teaching was conducted by teachers during the preparation of syllabus	1	12.5
2	The format of syllabus table explicitly contains the character values that are integrated in the learning	1	12.5
3	The strategy of assessment outlines the evaluation of test and non-test in written or oral form	7	67.5
4	Cultural values and character that will be integrated in the learning are derived from the standard competencies to basic competencies	3	37.5
5	The formulation of achievement indicators of competencies on lesson plan uses the operational work that outlines the cultural value of the nation's character	1	12.5
6	The formulation of learning objectives contains expected cultural values and character of the nation	3	37.5
7	Teaching methods that included lesson plan is in accordance with the basic competencies, learning objectives, teaching materials and source or teaching media	6	75
8	The design of the learning activities outlined in the lesson plan which is active, creative, effective and fun is aimed at formulating the statement in the learning activities in achieving the learning objectives	6	75
9	The lesson plan contains a program providing positive feedback, reinforcement, enrichment, ideals, habituation and remedial	7	87.5
10	The format of assessment is listed on lesson plan	1	12.5

Analysis of the Integration of Character Education in the Classroom Implementation

The results of the analysis of the implementation of the integration of character education in citizenship education learning in class VII-IX SMP N 5 Tavanjuka Palu based on learning methods and materials presented during the two periods are presented in the following table:

Table 2. Recapitulation of the implementation of the integration of Character Education in the Classroom

No	Character	Discussion				Lecturing				Total	%
		M1	M2	M3			M4		M5		
1	Religious	.	√	√	√	√	√	.	√	6	75
2	Honest	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	8	100
3	Tolerance	4	50
4	Discipline	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	8	100
5	Hard work	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	8	100
6	Creative	√	.	.	√	√	.	.	√	4	50
7	Independent	.	√	√	√	√	√	√	.	6	75
8	Democratic	.	√	√	√	√	√	√	.	6	75
9	Curiosity	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	8	100
10	Like to read	√	√	√	√	.	√	.	√	6	75
11	Appreciating the achievements	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	8	100
12	communicative	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	8	100
13	Environmental care	√	1	12.5
14	Responsible	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	8	100

Barriers in the Integration of Character Education in citizenship education Learning

The table 3 below shows the results of interviews with citizenship education teachers on barriers faced by teachers in an effort to integrate character education in citizenship education subjects class VII-IX at SMPN 5 Tavanjuka in the city of Palu.

Table 3. The barriers of Character Education

No	Indicators	Real Conditions
1	The barriers in integrating character education on citizenship education lesson	The time allocation for the citizen education subject is perceived very limited, while the burden of the material to be delivered by teachers to students is very solid
2	Complaints in integrating character education on citizenship education lesson	Teachers admitted that it is difficult to implement character education for each student during school hours due to the limitations of the learning device. In addition, infrastructure and learning tools are still very limited.
3	Suggestions for the implementation of the education of cultural values and nation character in schools	The burden of teaching and the teacher's task are reduced so that administrative tasks loaded to the teachers to meet the standards of the profession can be accomplished. On the contrary, administrative tasks of teachers profession are reduced in order to perform the tasks related to character education to students
4	The view of teachers on learning character which is implemented on citizenship education subjects and on all subjects at secondary school level, especially SMP Negeri 5 Tavanjuka Palu.	Whole informants both main and supporting informants state that basically character education has always been applied by the teacher to the student. However, methods, strategies, approaches and supporting materials are different. In addition, the title and the name are also different. In the past, it was called moral education, and now it is called character education.

V. Discussion

The planning for the integration of character education citizenship education learning at SMP Negeri 5 Tavanjuka has not been implemented optimally. It can be seen from the ten indicators of planning, and no indicator reaches 100% in its implementation. The format of syllabus contains strategies of non-test and tests in written or oral form regarding the performance, the attitude, and the work in the form of assignment.

However, SMP Negeri 5 Tavanjuka outlines attitude assessment form in the syllabus into the lesson plan in the assessment rubric and indicators of students' attitude which are expected when the lesson occurs. Meanwhile, some other schools do not do the same thing, and most of the teachers claimed that the attitude assessment is very hard to do so that teachers prefer not to describe the form of assessment in the lesson plan. In addition, other indicators on the integration of character education in the syllabus format are only fulfilled by some specific school in Palu, since some other schools did not revise the owned syllabus so that the syllabus which is each year has not changed.

Indicators of the integration of character education which are most often committed by teachers on lesson plan are the program of providing positive feedback, reinforcement, enrichment, ideals, habituation and remedial. They are described in some learning activities including the provision of an individual and group assignment, reflection, and homework. Meanwhile, other indicators such as the formulation of achievement of competencies and learning objectives are only written in accordance with the basic competencies that include cognitive. In addition, some schools only list of values and character that will be developed in learning without parsing the operational work. Therefore, the activities that reflect the values and character written in learning steps are not shown.

The selection of learning methods is in accordance with the needs, abilities, habits, and facilities which are available. However, in SMP Negeri 5 Tavanjuka Palu, syllabus and lesson plans created by teachers cannot be analyzed by the researchers since the concerned teacher is not able to provide the required syllabus and lesson plan. The syllabus and learning activities are analyzed and designed according to the predetermined indicators. The learning activities with the student-centered carried out by students and teachers only as an organizer of learning.

All the teachers who implement citizenship education learning in the classroom by integrating character education are based on the methods, strategies, and habits that they use or apply. There are five cultural values, and national characters carried out by all the teachers for all methods and teaching materials namely honesty, discipline, curiosity, hard work and friendly. On the contrary, the value of environmental care is only integrated by the teacher in teaching and in extra-curricular activities such as working or cleaning on Friday morning and Sunday morning.

However, its implementation is developed as a form of environmental sustainability in particular for the cleanliness and beauty of being used as a discussion of students about the role of plants against automatically which causes air pollution and greening in Palu city with the motto "Green and clean" by the teachers at SMPN 5 Tavanjuka Palu. Although there are still some values that can be developed through the discussion of this matter such as the value of discipline. Discussion on social and environmental care can also be developed by providing discipline value and training the students to comply with the rules at school, at home and in the community.

Teachers can train students to be discipline. Teachers can also provide reinforcement that students must comply with the rules on the importance of respect for others, the importance of obligations as a citizen and as a religious community. More specifically the sons and daughters of Tavanjuka are educated to learn to spread peace and brotherhood on earth of Tavanjuka. If students can comply with these rules, then their answers become correct and get high scores, as well as human behavior. Teachers can give emphasis when discussing the character that people who have high character values in the social environment is a human who obeys the rules. Therefore, students as civilized human beings must obey the rules and regulations in the environment of the school. In addition, the highest rank of individuals (human) in the eyes of God are individuals who have a high value of piety and good manners and who can provide exemplary for others.

One of the barriers faced by teachers in integrating character education is the density of the teacher's task especially for teachers who are certified. They are required to meet as much as 24 hours of teaching time, and it makes the teachers too busy in fulfilling the demands of teaching hours so that the administration cannot be executed properly. For instance, planning character education, designing lesson plans, assessing models that suit the needs, and revising the learning device that is not in accordance with the implementation have been ignored by the teachers. Therefore, the teacher gives advice to the relevant institution to reduce the number of teachers' teaching load so that teachers can perform other administrative tasks other than teaching in the classroom. Teachers feel that it is hard to observe the attitude of the students one by one in a short time in each meeting. In addition, the thing that is most felt by teachers in SMP Tavanjuka is the unavailability of learning facilities and adequate learning device.

The development of students' character should be observed gradually and continuously so that to assess the attitude, and the teacher can divide the students into small groups and examine one group of students in each meeting. In addition, teachers can create attitude indicator that wants to be assessed through observation of the students' attitudes during the lesson. Therefore, when one or more students display the indicators, teachers can mark the affective value list of the concerned student.

VI. Conclusion

Citizenship education learning contains the values reflected in the behavior of the characters and stories of community leaders, scholars, and the special people who inspire teens and deserves to be emulated by the younger generation as the central figure. Specifically, students at SMP Negeri 5 Tavanjuka Palu, in a review of culture and psychology, need internalization of the values of life to stimulate and motivate the formation of self-concept character through the cultivation of the values of life in the story of learning culture (habits) which are continuously transformed into culture. Character values are automatically integrated into the application of learning design which is innovative, interesting, and fun for students as strengthening empowerment of character education.

References

- [1] Bogdad. Robert. C and sari knapp bilken. (1982). Qualitative researc for education: amm introduction to theory and methods, allyn and balcon
- [2] Denzin, NK. Dan Lincoln, Y.S. (1994). Handbook of Qualitative Research UK.:Sage Publication, Inj.
- [3] Durkheim, E (dalam Megawangi,1961) Moral Education.New York: Free Press.
- [4] Depdiknas. (2001). Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia: Edisi Ketiga. Jakarta: BalaiPustaka.
- [5] Depdiknas. (2001). Undang-Undang RI Nomor 20 Tahun 2003 tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional: Jakarta: PN. Balai Pustaka
- [6] Frye, Mike at all. (Ed.) (2002). Character Education: Informational Handbook and Guidefor Support and Implementation of the Student Citizen Act of 2001. NorthCarolina: Public Schools of North Carolinachools of North Carolina
- [7] Fraenkel, Jack R. dan Norman E. Wallen. (2007). How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education. New York: McGraw Hill.
- Williams, J.R. Robin. 1960. Amerikan Society. New York:A Fred A Knopf.
- [8] Glanzer, Perry I dan Milson,Andrew J.A. Survey And Evaluation of Caracter Education Lawes In The United States:Educatinal Policy,Volume 20 Number 3 July 2006, p.525-550.
- [9] Henson, K.T. & Eller, B.E. 1999. Educational Psychology for Effective Teaching. Belmont: Wadsworth Publishing Company
- [10] Josepson, M. (2003). Character Count Network.April. p.21-25.
- [11] Kemendiknas. (2010). Pengembangan Pendidikan Budaya dan Karakter Tokohremaja: Pedoman Sekolah. Jakarta: Puskur.
- [12] Lickona, Thomas. (1991). Educating for Character: How Our School Can Teach Respec and Responsibility. New York, Toronto, London, Sydney, Aucland:Batambooks.
- [13] Lickona, Younna s, Egon G, Guba. (1985). Naturalistik Inuiry. London: Sage Publication, Barverly Hill.
- [14] Mubarak. (2008). Membumikan Pendidikan Nilai: Mengumpulkan yang Terserak.Menyambung yang Terputus, dan Menyatukan yang Tercerai. Bandung:Alfabeta.

Implementation Of Character Education: Case Study Of Citizenship Education Subject At Junior

- [15] Nucci, Larry (Ed.). (1989). *Moral Development and Character Education: A dialogue*. Berkley Publishing California: McCutchan.
- [16] Soedarsono, Soemarno. (2010). *Karakter Mengantar Tokoh remaja dari Gelap Menuju Terang*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- [17] Yusuf, Syamsu dan A. Juntika Nurihsan. *Landasan Bimbingan dan Konseling*. Bandung : Remaja Rosdakarya.
- [18] Koentjaraningrat. (1977). *Metode-Metode Penelitian Masyarakat*. Jakarta: Gramedia
- [19] Sukmadinata, Nana S. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. Bandung : Remaja Rosdakarya dan Pascasarjana UPI.
- [20] Sugiyono, (2010). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan: Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.

Gusnarib " Implementation of Character Education: Case Study of Citizenship Education Subject at Junior High School in Paul, Indonesia." *IOSR Journal of Research & Method in Education (IOSR-JRME)* , vol. 8, no. 2, 2018, pp. 01-07.

Implementation of Character Education: Case Study of Citizenship Education Subject at Junior High School in Paul, Indonesia

ORIGINALITY REPORT

12%

SIMILARITY INDEX

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	journal.upp.ac.id Internet	104 words — 2%
2	europub.co.uk Internet	77 words — 2%
3	eprints.unm.ac.id Internet	63 words — 1%
4	repository.uinbanten.ac.id Internet	56 words — 1%
5	ejurnal.unisri.ac.id Internet	52 words — 1%
6	moam.info Internet	36 words — 1%
7	vickryadjah.blogspot.com Internet	33 words — 1%
8	etheses.uin-malang.ac.id Internet	25 words — 1%
9	ejournal.uin-suka.ac.id Internet	19 words — < 1%

10	asian-efl-journal.com Internet	17 words — < 1%
11	docshare.tips Internet	15 words — < 1%
12	pt.scribd.com Internet	11 words — < 1%
13	serialsjournals.com Internet	11 words — < 1%
14	repository.unimal.ac.id Internet	9 words — < 1%
15	www.internationaljournalsrsg.org Internet	9 words — < 1%

EXCLUDE QUOTES ON

EXCLUDE MATCHES

< 5 WORDS

EXCLUDE BIBLIOGRAPHY ON