

# JEES

*by* Abdul Gafur Marzuki

---

**Submission date:** 24-Jun-2023 11:29AM (UTC+0700)

**Submission ID:** 2121732117

**File name:** jees.pdf (635.49K)

**Word count:** 3994

**Character count:** 21531



## Utilizing smartphone-based Pinterest applications in developing EFL students speaking skills in Indonesia

Muthmainnah,<sup>1</sup> Abdul Gafur Marzuki\*,<sup>2</sup> Nursyam,<sup>1</sup> Santiana,<sup>3</sup> Erizar<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>English Education Department, Al Asyariah Mandar University, Indonesia,

<sup>2</sup>English Education Department, UIN Datokarama Palu, Indonesia

<sup>3</sup>English Education Department, Siliwangi University, Indonesia

<sup>4</sup>English Education Department, STAIN Teungku Dirundeng Meulaboh, Indonesia

This study raises the issue of how to improve speaking skills using the smartphone-based Pinterest application for second-semester students. The purpose of this study was to determine the improvement of speaking skills using the smartphone-based Pinterest application for second-semester students. The type of research used in this research is Classroom Action Research (CAR), which is carried out in 2 cycles. The research subjects are second-semester students. The research instruments are an observation sheet and a performance test sheet. Data collection techniques are used in the form of tests and non-tests. The data analysis technique used is the descriptive statistical technique. The result of the study on second-semester students showed a good increase from the learning outcomes of the first cycle to the second cycle, with a standard value of student learning mastery of 85 classical standards. The average value in the first cycle is 48.00, with the level of completeness of learning outcomes in the first cycle of 10% and 90% incomplete. While the learning outcomes in the second cycle have an average value of 85.76 with a completion level of 96%, this figure indicates that the average value of the first cycle and the second cycle has increased, so that the smartphone-based Pinterest application in improving speaking skills can improve student learning outcomes.

**Keywords:** EFL Students, Pinterest application, Smartphone application, Speaking

### OPEN ACCESS

ISSN 2503 3492 (online)

\*Correspondence:

Abdul Gafur Marzuki  
gbudiperwira@gmail.com

Received: 25th May 2022

Accepted: 11th October 2022

Published: 27th October 2022

Citation:

Muthmainnah, M., Marzuki, A. G., Santiana, S., Erizar, E., & Nursyam, N. (2022). Utilizing smartphone-based Pinterest applications in developing EFL students speaking skills in Indonesia. *JEES (Journal of English Educators Society)*, 7(2).  
<https://doi.org/10.21070/jees.v7i2.1672>

### INTRODUCTION

The industrial revolution in the scope of education is a target that is a tool of endeavor to foster human civilization in the virtual era. Changes in the field of education are a response to students where technology is aligned to create new opportunities creatively and innovatively. Learning at different times and places is characteristic of education in the Revolutionary Era. Students will have more to learn at different times and places.

Language learning with new literacy perspectives in universities in the Industrial Revolution Era requires universities to implement new literacy (data literacy, technological literacy, and human literacy) (Aoun, 2017; Hobbs, 2018; Jalinus, 2021; Khan et al., 2021). In addition to increasing student understanding of linguistic material, new literacy improves writing and speaking skills based on data and technology. This literacy has become the spirit of students in writing journalistic works, scientific works, and literary works.

The implementation of literacy is determined by Indonesian language lecturers who have digital competence, create creative learning and think critically, and are based online (Fatimah & Santiana, 2017; Sun et al., 2017; Zou et al., 2018; Marzuki, 2019; Saleh, 2019; Alek et al., 2020; Sarjana et al., 2021).

Speaking is a language skill that develops in a child's life, which is only preceded by listening skills, and that's when the ability to speak is learned. Learning speaking skills is a very important skill to be studied for students because, through learning to speak, students are expected to be able to convey or express thoughts, opinions, ideas, and feelings well. However, learning to speak would be better if it was done through practice, not through speaking theories. If teaching speaking exercises can be done through the speech method, which includes asking questions, exploring questions, describing pictures, and telling stories (Hwang et al., 2016; McMillan & Saffran, 2016; Terrell & Watson, 2018; Andujar & Salaberri-Ramiro, 2021).

During the COVID-19 pandemic, smartphone technology played an important role in the student learning process, so the use of smartphones grew very rapidly in Indonesia and was able to provide great benefits for students in online learning activities. The benefits felt by students when using smartphones in the learning process are that it is easy to get information or learning materials that are not contained in text books. In addition, smartphones can be used as a learning medium, for example, by lecturers who give group assignments to students. The lecturer instructs students to do assignments via the WhatsApp application (Ahn & Lee, 2016; Abugohar et al., 2019; Alsied, 2019; Chaya & Inpin, 2020; Metruk, 2020).

In connection with the current problem, namely the low speaking ability of students, in this study, the researchers applied smartphone-based online learning with the Pinterest application. Pinterest media can help in an effective and interesting learning process (Chang, 2016; McClaren, 2019). The use of Pinterest media can help the interaction process between students and lecturers obtain the desired goals in the learning process (Hu et al., 2018; Schroeder et al., 2019; Kumar & Nanda, 2020).

Freedom to learn is something given by the Minister of Education and Culture as a policy to students so that learning is carried out according to their interests and character. Some teachers apply conservative teaching methods. They give instructions to students like being spoonfed. Everyone has a different way of learning. During this COVID-19 pandemic, it has paralyzed various sectors, one of which is the education sector (Kassem, 2018; Klimova & Polakova, 2020). The COVID-19 pandemic has caused the world of education to be closed. Schools are closed, and campuses are closed too. Instead, educational activities are carried out at home. Working from Home (WFH) is the best solution so that educational activities and the teaching and learning process can continue. Based on some of these explanations, this article talks about how students can improve their speaking skills after using the Pinterest app on their phones.

## METHODS

The type of research used in this research is classroom action research. This research consists of four stages, namely planning, implementing actions, observing (observing), and reflecting (Marzuki, 2017; Kulihaana & Marzuki, 2020), which are carried out in two cycles. The research subjects are the second-semester students at Al Asyariah Mandar University, Polewali Mandar, totaling 30 students. The instruments used to collect data are the performance test sheet and the observation sheet. Data collection techniques are tests and non-tests. The data analysis technique used is descriptive statistical analysis by analyzing the average value and the percentage of learning outcomes in each cycle. The following are the steps of the research:

1. Preliminary activities, determining learning topics, and compiling evaluation tools.
2. Researchers convey learning objectives, ask students' readiness to learn, researchers explain outlines about learning, researchers ask students to upload applications that will be used as learning media, explain the use of the application, and explain how to enter an account on the Pinterest application. At the next meeting, the researcher took the value of speaking practice on the students.
3. Observing: Since the purpose of observing is to collect data dealing with both researchers and students during the process of teaching and learning, the researchers try to collect it as much as possible by using field notes while collaborators fill in observation sheets which have been prepared for observing students' progress and classroom atmosphere. Indeed, at the end of each cycle, the researchers give a speaking test.
4. Reflection results based on the results of the research, it can be seen that at the time of carrying out speaking scores using the Pinterest application media with speech material, it can be seen that in the first cycle the success indicators have not been achieved, so that further research is carried out in cycle II.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In the initial observations, it was stated that speaking skills in second-semester students were very low and no students or lecturers had used the Pinterest application as a learning medium, so that speaking skills to students in front were still many who experienced fear, nervousness, and stage fright. Because students' speaking skills are still low, they use the Pinterest application to improve them.

The following are the results of the speaking skill test in the first cycle.

The results of the speaking skills test assessment in the table 1 using the Pinterest application in the first cycle showed that some students had low speaking skills which had obtained a very poor category, namely 18 or equal to 60% of students scored less than 50, and the lowest category was 9 or equal to 30% of students who got a score of 50-64, and 3 of the students had reached the good category, which

scores 81-90 or equal to 10%. There are no students who get a score of 90–100 in the very good category, and there are no students who get a good enough category and a not enough category. With this, the speaking skills of second-semester students still need to be improved.

**TABLE 1** | Table of speaking skills test results in the early stages. (cycle I)

No	Category	Range Value	F	%
1	Very good	91-100	0	0
2	Good	81-90	3	10
25	Fairly good	75-80	0	0
4	Enough	65-74	0	0
5	Less	50-64	9	30
6	Very poor	<50	18	60
	Total		30	100

**TABLE 2** | Percentage table in early stage

Percentage Score	Category	F	%
Score 80 and above	Complete	3	10
Score below 80	Incomplete	27	90

Based on the completeness percentage [table 2](#) above, it shows that as many as 3 students scored above 80 and were declared complete individually; as many as 27 students scored below 80 and were declared incomplete individually.

**TABLE 3** | Frequency distribution table in early stage

No	Score	Category	F	%
1	91-100	Very good	0	0
2	81-90	Good	3	10
3	75-80	Fairly good	0	0
4	65-74	Enough	0	0
5	50-64	Less	9	30
6	<50	Very poor	18	60

In the frequency distribution [table 3](#), it is known that 2 students scored 83, 9 students scored 50 and 60, 18 students scored 33 and 46, and 1 student scored 86.

### Cycle I. Research Results

1. Action planning, namely: preliminary activities and determining learning topics, and compiling evaluation tools.
2. Implementation of actions, namely: researchers convey learning objectives, ask students' readiness to learn, researchers explain outlines about learning, researchers ask students to upload applications that will be used as learning media, explain the use of the application, and explain how to enter an account on the Pinterest application and at the next meeting the researcher took the value of speaking practice on the student.
3. Learning outcomes. Based on the descriptive and average results using the Pinterest application with the highest score of 86 and the lowest value of 23. So that the value

of the results on speaking skills is still very low, this is with the value of the practice of speaking using the Pinterest application has obtained an average value of the whole students, namely 48.67%. With the percentage of completeness of all students as much as 10% and 90% of students who did [9](#) complete.

4. Reflection results. Based on the results of the research, it can be seen that at the time of carrying out speaking scores using the Pinterest application media with speech material, it can be seen that in the first cycle the success indicators have not been achieved so that further research is carried out or cycle II.

### Cycle II Research Results

1. Results of observations of students. With the practice of speaking using the Pinterest application as a learning tool with an average score of 85.44% of students' overall score, it shows that the overall practice value of students reaches a good category.
2. Learning outcomes. Based on the value of individual speaking practice with an average value of 96.00 and the percentage of completeness 97%, this indicates that learning outcomes from cycle I to cycle II have increased.

**TABLE 4** | Table of speaking skills test results in the second stage

No	Category	Range value	F	%
1	Very good	91-100	5	16
2	Good	81-90	21	70
3	Fairly good	75-80	4	14
4	Enough	65-74	0	0
5	Less	50-64	0	0
6	Very poor	<50	0	0
	Total		30	100

In [table 4](#), the results of the speaking skill test assessment using the Pinterest application in cycle II have shown that the average student speaking ability achieved is in a good category, namely 21 or equal to 70% of students getting a score of 81-90, and the category is quite good as much as 4 or equal to 14% of students where students scored 75-80, and 5 of the students had reached the very good category which scored 91-100 or equal to 16%. With this, the second-semester students' speaking skills have improved quite well.

**TABLE 5** | The percentage table in the second stage

Percentage Score	Category	F	%
Score 80 and above	Complete	29	97
Score below 80	Incomplete	1	3

Based on the completeness percentage [table 5](#) above, it shows that as many as 29 students or equal to 97% scored above 80 and were declared complete individually; as many as 1 student or equal to 3% obtained scores below 80 and were declared incomplete individually.

**TABLE 6** | Frequency distribution table in the second stage

No	Score	Category	F	%
1	91-100	Very good	0	0
2	81-90	Good	3	10
3	75-80	Fairly good	0	0
4	65-74	Enough	0	0
5	50-64	Less	9	30
6	<50	Very poor	18	60

Based on the completeness percentage [table 6](#) above, it shows that as many as 29 students or equal to 97% scored above 80 and were declared complete individually, as many as 1 student or equal to 3% obtained scores below 80 and were declared incomplete individually.

This section discusses the results of research on student speaking skills using the Pinterest smartphone-based application in second-semester students which have been described in the [research results](#). The discussion focused on the findings of [learning activities in cycles I and II](#). The second cycle of discussion includes: (1) the results of observations on students' speaking skills using the Pinterest application for the students; (2) the results of the assessment of students' speaking skills using the Pinterest application, while the results of the assessment are based on the assessed aspects which include pressure, grammar, vocabulary, fluency, understanding of the things being discussed. The results of the assessment based on the aspects assessed from cycle I to cycle II, namely (1) student skills in terms of aspects of pressure on speech reading and host script reading increased by 2.03; (2) student skills in terms of grammatical aspects have increased by 2.2; (3) students' speaking skills in the vocabulary aspect increased by 2.04; (4) students' speaking skills in the fluency aspect have increased by 2.4; (5) students' speaking skills in the aspect of understanding what is read or delivered have increased by 2.14. Based on the average rating in cycles I and II, the increase from cycle I to cycle II is 1.47%, so it can be concluded that speaking skills using the Pinterest application in second-semester students have increased from cycle I to cycle II.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the results of research and discussion, it is concluded that the application of speaking skills using the Pinterest application can improve students' speaking skills. This can be seen from the results of descriptive statistical data analysis which shows that in the first cycle only 3 students or 10% have completed, while in the second cycle, the students' mastery has increased to 29 students or 97% completed. The average score also shows an increase. In the first cycle, the average value obtained by students was only 48.11 and increased to 85.46 in the second cycle. This means that the use of the Pinterest application can improve students' speaking skills.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to thank you to all the students who were becoming the participants of this research and also some colleagues for their fruitful suggestions, comments, and serious edits throughout this manuscript. Finally, we also express our gratitude to anonymous reviewers of this journal for insightful notes and comments.

## REFERENCES

- Abugohar, M. A., Yunus, K., & Rashid, R. A. (2019). Smartphone applications as a teaching technique for enhancing tertiary learners' speaking skills: Perceptions and Practices. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning*, 14(9). <https://doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v14i09.10375>
- Ahn, T. Y., & Lee, S. M. (2016). User experience of a mobile speaking application with automatic speech recognition for EFL learning. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 47(4), 778-786. <https://doi.org/10.1111/bjet.12354>
- Alek, A., Marzuki, A. G., Farkhan, M., & Deni, R. (2020). Self-assessment in exploring EFL students' speaking skill. *Al-Ta'lim Journal*, 27(2), 208-214. <https://doi.org/10.15548/jt.v27i2.613>
- Alsied, S. M. (2019). The role of mobile phones as effective tools for language learning by Libyan EFL learners. *JEELS (Journal of English Education and Linguistics Studies)*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/10.30762/jeels.v6i2.114>
- Andujar, A., & Salaberri-Ramiro, M. S. (2021). Exploring chat-based communication in the EFL class: computer and mobile environments. *Computer-assisted language learning*, 34(4), 434-461. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2019.1614632>
- Aoun, J. E. (2017). *Robot-proof: higher education in the age of artificial intelligence*. MIT press.
- Chang, C. M. (2016). *Influences of new media communication on the deaf/hard of hearing as reflected in interaction design*. Nottingham Trent University (United Kingdom).
- Chaya, P., & Inpin, B. (2020). Effects of integrating movie-based mobile learning instruction for enhancing Thai university students' speaking skills and intercultural communicative competence. *English Language Teaching*, 13(7), 27-45. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v13n7p27>
- Fatimah, A. S., & Santiana, S. (2017). Teaching in 21st century: Students-teachers' perceptions of technology use in the classroom. *Script Journal: Journal of Linguistic and English Teaching*, 2(2), 125. <https://doi.org/10.24903/sj.v2i2.132>
- Hobbs, R. (2018). Expanding the concept of literacy. In *Media literacy in the information age* (pp. 163-183). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351292924-7>
- Hu, S., Torphy, K. T., Opperman, A., Jansen, K., & Lo, Y. J. (2018). What do teachers share within socialized knowledge communities: A case of Pinterest. *Journal of Professional Capital and Community*.

- <https://doi.org/10.1108/jpcc-11-2017-0025>
- Hwang, W. Y., Shih, T. K., Ma, Z. H., Shadiev, R., & Chen, S. Y. (2016). Evaluating listening and speaking skills in a mobile game-based learning environment with situational contexts. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 29(4), 639-657.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2015.1016438>
- Jalinus, N. (2021). Developing blended learning model in vocational education based on 21st century integrated learning and industrial revolution 4.0. *Turkish Journal of Computer and Mathematics Education (TURCOMAT)*, 12(8), 1239-1254.
- Kassem, M. A. M. (2018). The effect of a suggested in-service teacher training program based on MALL applications on developing EFL students' vocabulary acquisition. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 9(2), 250-260.  
<https://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0902.05>
- Khan, R. M. I., Radzuan, N. R. M., Farooqi, S. U. H., Shahbaz, M., & Khan, M. S. (2021). Learners' perceptions on whatsapp integration as a learning tool to develop EFL vocabulary for speaking skill. *International Journal of Language Education*, 5(2), 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.26858/ijole.v5i2.15787>
- Klimova, B., & Polakova, P. (2020). Students' perceptions of an EFL vocabulary learning mobile application. *Education Sciences*, 10(2), 37.  
<https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci10020037>
- Kuliahana, A., & Marzuki, A. G. (2020). Repetition technique in an EFL speaking class in Islamic higher education in Indonesia. *Academic Journal Perspective: Education, Language, and Literature*, 8(1), 20-28.  
<https://doi.org/10.33603/perspective.v8i1.3295>
- Kumar, V., & Nanda, P. (2020). Social media as a tool in higher education: A pedagogical perspective. In *Handbook of research on diverse teaching strategies for the technology-rich classroom* (pp. 239-253). IGI Global.  
<https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-0238-9.ch016>
- Marzuki, A. G. (2019). Utilizing recorded English dialogues in teaching English word stress to Islamic higher education students in Indonesia. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(1), 53-64.  
<https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v5i1.4297>
- Marzuki, A.G. (2017). Developing speaking skill through oral report in an EFL class in Indonesia. *Al-Ta'lim Journal*, 24(3), 243-254.  
<https://doi.org/10.15548/jt.v24i3.330>
- McClaren, M. (2019). Revisioning environmental literacy in the context of a global information and communications ecosphere. *The Journal of Environmental Education*, 50(4-6), 416-435.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00958964.2019.1687408>
- McMillan, B. T., & Saffran, J. R. (2016). Learning in complex environments: The effects of background speech on early word learning. *Child Development*, 87(6), 1841-1855.  
<https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12559>
- Metruk, R. (2020). EFL learners' perspectives on the use of smartphones in Higher Education settings in Slovakia. *Electronic Journal of e-Learning*, 18(6), pp537-549.  
<https://doi.org/10.34190/jel.18.6.006>
- Saleh, S. T. (2019). Chat and Learn: Effectiveness of using whatsapp as a pedagogical tool to enhance EFL learners' reading and writing skills. *International Journal of English Language and Literature Studies*, 8(2), 61-68.  
<https://doi.org/10.18488/journal.23.2019.82.61.68>
- Santiana, S., Lesmana, D. S., Marzuki, A. G., & Erizar, E. (2021). An insight of anitales apps perceived by digital storytelling students. In *Proceeding of International Conference on Islamic Education (ICIED)*, 6(1), pp. 23-30.  
<https://doi.org/10.31219/osf.io/acph6>
- Schroeder, S., Curcio, R., & Lundgren, L. (2019). Expanding the learning network: How teachers use Pinterest. *Journal of research on technology in education*, 51(2), 166-186.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/15391523.2019.1573354>
- Sun, Z., Lin, C. H., You, J., Shen, H. J., Qi, S., & Luo, L. (2017). Improving the English-speaking skills of young learners through mobile social networking. *Computer assisted language learning*, 30(3-4), 304-324.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2017.1308384>
- Terrell, P., & Watson, M. (2018). Laying a firm foundation: Embedding evidence-based emergent literacy practices into early intervention and preschool environments. *Language, Speech, and Hearing Services in Schools*, 49(2), 148-164.  
[https://doi.org/10.1044/2017\\_lshss-17-0053](https://doi.org/10.1044/2017_lshss-17-0053)
- Zou, B., Li, H., & Li, J. (2018). Exploring a curriculum app and a social communication app for EFL learning. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 31(7), 694-713. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2018.1438474>

**Conflict of Interest Statement:** The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Copyright © 2022 Muthmainnah, Abdul Gafur Marzuki, Nursyam, Santiana, Erizar. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.

## ORIGINALITY REPORT

18%

SIMILARITY INDEX

17%

INTERNET SOURCES

12%

PUBLICATIONS

5%

STUDENT PAPERS

## PRIMARY SOURCES

1	<a href="http://repository.uin-malang.ac.id">repository.uin-malang.ac.id</a> Internet Source	2%
2	<a href="http://repository.uindatokarama.ac.id">repository.uindatokarama.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%
3	<a href="http://www.scilit.net">www.scilit.net</a> Internet Source	1%
4	<a href="http://repository.uinsu.ac.id">repository.uinsu.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%
5	Submitted to Universitas Negeri Surabaya The State University of Surabaya Student Paper	1%
6	<a href="http://repository.uinjambi.ac.id">repository.uinjambi.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%
7	<a href="http://repository.unikama.ac.id">repository.unikama.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%
8	<a href="http://www.journal.ikipsiliwangi.ac.id">www.journal.ikipsiliwangi.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%
9	<a href="http://www.academypublication.com">www.academypublication.com</a> Internet Source	1%

10	<a href="http://journal.upgris.ac.id">journal.upgris.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1 %
11	<a href="http://digilib.uinsby.ac.id">digilib.uinsby.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1 %
12	<a href="http://eprints.ums.ac.id">eprints.ums.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1 %
13	<a href="http://www.syncsci.com">www.syncsci.com</a> Internet Source	1 %
14	Juni Ernawati Manjorang. "Inquiry Learning Model at SMK Negeri 6 Masni District, West Papua Year of Study 2021/2022", MATAI: International Journal of Language Education, 2021 Publication	<1 %
15	<a href="http://ejournal.stitpn.ac.id">ejournal.stitpn.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
16	Devinta Puspita Ratri, Peptia Asrining Tyas. "Review Locally Tailored ELT Textbooks to Meet Primary Students' Need: Textbooks Development", JEES (Journal of English Educators Society), 2022 Publication	<1 %
17	<a href="http://www.ijern.com">www.ijern.com</a> Internet Source	<1 %
18	Hanoi National University of Education Publication	<1 %



19 Lamhot Naibaho. "THE EFFECTIVENESS OF NUMBER HEAD TOGETHER STRATEGY ON IMPROVING STUDENTS' ENGLISH ACHIEVEMENT AT XYZ SCHOOL", International Journal of Research -GRANTHAALAYAH, 2020  
Publication <1 %

---

20 Thirumangai Rajendran, Melor Md Yunus. "Chatterpix Kids: A Potential Mobile App for Helping Primary ESL Pupils Improve Their Speaking Fluency", International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research, 2021  
Publication <1 %

---

21 [baru.edunesia.org](http://baru.edunesia.org)  
Internet Source <1 %

---

22 [citejournal.org](http://citejournal.org)  
Internet Source <1 %

---

23 [essuir.sumdu.edu.ua](http://essuir.sumdu.edu.ua)  
Internet Source <1 %

---

24 [jim.bbg.ac.id](http://jim.bbg.ac.id)  
Internet Source <1 %

---

25 [moam.info](http://moam.info)  
Internet Source <1 %

---

26 [www.innovatio.pasca.uinjambi.ac.id](http://www.innovatio.pasca.uinjambi.ac.id)  
Internet Source <1 %

---

[www.journalppw.com](http://www.journalppw.com)

27

Internet Source

<1 %

---

28

[www.journal.tarbiyahainib.ac.id](http://www.journal.tarbiyahainib.ac.id)

Internet Source

<1 %

---

Exclude quotes      On

Exclude matches      Off

Exclude bibliography      On