



Syaakir Sofyan <baangsofyan@gmail.com>

Trs: Decision on TR-08-2020-0390.R3

1 pesan

a.syathir@uin-alauddin.ac.id <a.syathir@uin-alauddin.ac.id>
Balas Ke: "a.syathir@uin-alauddin.ac.id" <a.syathir@uin-alauddin.ac.id>
Kepada: Syaakir Sofyan <baangsofyan@gmail.com>

7 April 2021 pukul 07.55

Dikirim dari Yahoo Mail di Android

----- Pesan yang Diteruskan -----

Dari: "Tourism Review" <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>**Kepada:** "a.syathir@uin-alauddin.ac.id" <a.syathir@uin-alauddin.ac.id>**Cc:****Terkirim:** Rab, 7 Apr 2021 pada 6:23**Judul:** Decision on TR-08-2020-0390.R3

06-Apr-2021

Dear Dear ##PROLE_AUTHOR_FULLNAME#,

Manuscript ID TR-08-2020-0390.R3 entitled "CRISIS AND DISASTER MANAGEMENT FOR HALAL TOURISM: A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW" which you submitted to Tourism Review, has been reviewed. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) suggest some minor revisions to your manuscript and I am pleased to inform you that I am WILLING TO ACCEPT your article to Tourism Review subject to you making some minor revisions to your manuscript. Address the following changes/improvements as soon as possible. Please check all aspects of the paper very carefully.

PLEASE MAKE SURE THAT YOU ADDRESS THE FOLLOWING :

CLEAR THEORETICAL AND PRACTICE CONTRIBUTION

- You should showcase the original contribution of the paper in the paper's Abstract, Introduction and Conclusion. Demonstrate clearly the theoretical and practice contribution of your paper.
- Include a structured abstract in page 1 of the main document and make sure that it includes all the requires subsections.
- Findings in your abstract should clearly communicate what is new and why it is significant
- Use the right keywords so your paper can be discovered.
- Add a Figure or a Table to visually demonstrate your contribution. Summarising the key findings of this paper in a visual way that can be easily shared and represent the main contribution to theory and practice.

PROOF-READING AND WORD COUNT

- Follow the Tourism Review author guidelines closely: http://www.emeraldgroupublishing.com/products/journals/author_guidelines.htm?id=tr
- Keep your article below 6000 words including references, tables and figures. Exceeding by 10% is acceptable but not more than that.
- Proofread your article one more time and also you may ask a native speaker to proofread it for you.
- You may like to employ a professional academic editor to help you if you are not a native speaker

REFERENCING Final and detailed check

1. Make sure you follow the TOURISM REVIEW referencing format
2. Cross check all references within text with your reference list.
3. Add more recent and relevant references published in recent months/years.
4. Check all the names of authors - both in terms of the names and the special characters
5. Cross check the references against the citations to make sure that they fully correspond
6. Check all the pre-published papers to make sure that none of the pre-published is not already fully published and report the correct version of the reference

7. Check ALL the formatting requirements as reported in the Journal's home page listed above and make sure that the submission follows them (and do not forget to include your short cvs - as it is required)

SIMILARITY REPORT

- Run your article through Turnitin, iThenticate, Crosscheck or any similar software to check the similarity between your study and previous studies. *****Minimize similarity percentage below 1% from any previous study and less than 15% overall.***** After you run your article's final version through iThenticate or other similar software, you should upload the similarity report to the system for our records.

AUTHORSHIP REPORT

- YOU MUST DECLARE THE ROLE AND CONTRIBUTION OF EACH AUTHOR ON A SEPARATE DOCUMENT. THIS NEEDS TO BE SIGNED BY ALL AUTHORS.
- Include a 50 words Author Biography for each author
- Please provide an analytical explanation of what is the contribution of each author to the article and confirm the order of the authors. You need to create a list assigning a person's name against the following roles or tasks:
 1. Conception or design of the work.
 2. Data collection.
 3. Data analysis and interpretation.
 4. Drafting the article.
 5. Critical revision of the article.
 6. Final approval of the version to be published.

TRANSLATE YOUR STRUCTURED ABSTRACT

- into Chinese and Spanish to be printed with the paper-Make sure you translate the title and the keywords – please add English/Chinese/Spanish abstract at the beginning of the paper and send them to Dr Daisy Fan dfan@bournemouth.ac.uk

DISSEMINATION AND ANOUNCEMENT

- Think of the key messages that you can disseminate on social media to increase the interest to this paper
- Use your Academia.edu, ResearchGate, Mendeley profile and your personal website to upload a “preprint”. This is your own original or draft version of the paper
- invite colleagues, students, and the authors that you quote to download and use the article.

SUBMIT FINALLY

- A clean version of your paper. You don't need to show/highlight all the changes made in the paper. I will read its final version anyway.
- A brief report showing how you have responded to the above requests. You don't need to show/highlight all the changes made in the paper. I will read its final version anyway.

ABSTRACT It is critical that your abstract clearly demonstrates clearly what the paper is about and what is the theoretical contribution. In the FINDINGS section of the abstract the contribution of the paper needs to be crystal clear.

ENGAGE WITH THE TOURISM REVIEW LATEST ARTICLES

You should engage with the style and the discussions recently published in Tourism Review. In order to do so, you would need to demonstrate familiarity with the work of other contemporary scholars working in the field to which you are submitting. Your paper seem that has neglected to look into Tourism Review as a leading journal in the field with 75 years history. The work in the journal evolved considerably as you can see the most recent issues on <https://www.emerald.com/insight/publication/issn/1660-5373#earlycite>
<https://www.emerald.com/insight/publication/issn/1660-5373>

In particular you should engage in conversation with the latest publications addressing your topic including:

Rahman, M, Moghavvemi, S, Thirumoorthi, T, & ... (2020). The impact of tourists' perceptions on halal tourism destination: a structural model analysis. Tourism ..., [emerald.com](https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/TR-05-2019-0182/full/html), <<https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/TR-05-2019-0182/full/html>>

Okumus, B (2020). Food tourism research: a perspective article. Tourism Review, [emerald.com](https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/TR-11-2019-0450/full/html), <<https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/TR-11-2019-0450/full/html>>

Wang, L, & Wong, PPW (2020). Marketing of environmentally friendly hotels in China through religious segmentation: a theory of planned behaviour approach. Tourism Review, [emerald.com](https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/TR-08-2019-0327/full/html), <<https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/TR-08-2019-0327/full/html>>

Kamassi, A, Manaf, NH Abd, & Omar, A (2020). The identity and role of stakeholders in the medical tourism industry: state of the art. Tourism Review, [emerald.com](https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/TR-01-2019-0031/full/html), <<https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/TR-01-2019-0031/full/html>>

Samarathunga, W, & Cheng, L (2020). Tourist gaze and beyond: state of the art. *Tourism Review*, [emerald.com](https://www.emerald.com/insight/publication/issn/1660-5373), <<https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/TR-06-2020-0248/full/html>>

As we are trying to facilitate timely publication of *Tourism Review* manuscripts your revised manuscript should be uploaded as soon as possible. If it is not possible for you to submit your revision in a reasonable amount of time, we may have to consider your paper as a new submission.

Please note that Emerald requires you to clear permission to re-use any material not created by you. If there are permissions outstanding, please upload these when you submit your revision or send directly to Emerald if your paper is accepted immediately. Emerald is unable to publish your paper with permissions outstanding.

~~~~~

*Tourism Review* <https://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/journal/tr> is the oldest journal dedicated to tourism issues bringing the best tourism research ever since 1946! now on its 76th Volume. It advances tourism knowledge and enhances the impact and relevance of tourism research to global society at large. *Tourism Review* publishes research papers, systematic literature reviews (state of the art), short interventions (perspective papers) and research innovations (cutting edge). It provides original, creative, multi- and interdisciplinary contributions on a very wide range of issues and has an international focus and audience. The Clarivate Impact Factor in 2019 was 2.908 and the Scopus CiteScore Tracker in January 2021 was 4.1. *Tourism Review* is a Q1 Journal in SCIMAGO Journal Ranking (SJR). In 2020 it received 620 papers and it published 105 papers including 75 perspective papers in the Jubilee Special issue 75(1) celebrating 75 years of *Tourism Review*.  
<https://www.emerald.com/insight/publication/issn/1660-5373>

---

To revise your manuscript, log into <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tr> and enter your Author Centre, where you will find your manuscript title listed under "Manuscripts with Decisions." Under "Actions," click on "Create a Revision." Your manuscript number has been appended to denote a revision.

You will be unable to make your revisions on the originally submitted version of the manuscript. Instead, revise your manuscript using a word processing program and save it on your computer. Please also highlight the changes to your manuscript within the document by using the track changes mode in MS Word or by using bold or coloured text.

Once the revised manuscript is prepared, you can upload it and submit it through your Author Centre.

When submitting your revised manuscript, you will be able to respond to the comments made by the reviewer(s) in the space provided. You should use this space to document any changes you make to the original manuscript. In order to expedite the processing of the revised manuscript, please be as specific as possible in your response to the reviewer(s).

**IMPORTANT:** Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

Please note that Emerald requires you to clear permission to re-use any material not created by you. If there are permissions outstanding, please send these to Emerald as soon as possible. Emerald is unable to publish your paper with permissions outstanding.

Because Emerald is trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to *Tourism Review*, your revised manuscript should be uploaded as soon as possible. If it is not possible for you to submit your revision in a reasonable amount of time, let me know; otherwise I may have to consider your paper as a new submission.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to *Tourism Review* and I look forward to receiving your revision.

We experience dramatic growth of the journal in submissions, quality and impact. See for yourself <https://www.emerald.com/insight/publication/issn/1660-5373#earlycite>

See all author guidelines on <https://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/journal/tr>

---

Yours sincerely,  
Professor Dimitrios Buhalis  
Editor in Chief  
*Tourism Review*

dbuhalis@bournemouth.ac.uk  
<https://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/journal/tr>

## REVIEWERS EVALUATION:

Reviewer: 1

Recommendation: Accept

### Comments:

I'd like to congratulate the author for being able to nicely present a set of Islamic concepts related to disaster management. Your ideas put forward in this paper should pave the way for further research and exploration by other researchers regarding the Islamic concepts related to this disaster management and other related areas of management.

### Additional Questions:

1. Originality: Does the paper contain new and significant information adequate to justify publication?: Yes, the paper proposes a very strong concept of planning from Islamic perspective, i.e., the pleasure of Allah (mardhatillah), which is the first ever Islamic concept for dealing with disaster management introduced in a scholarly work.
2. Relationship to Literature: Does the paper demonstrate an adequate understanding of the relevant literature in the field and cite an appropriate range of literature sources? Is any significant work ignored?: Yes, very much. The author has illustrated his good understanding of the relevant literature. This is reflected in his citation of several previous research works " According to Joakim and White, (2015, p. 202) that religious leaders (ustadz) provide a form of resilience to society through their main role in providing emotional and psychological support for trauma recovery. The role of the leaders can be felt if it fulfills the characteristics of trust (amanah) (Hassib and Ibtissem, 2020, p. 162), Good Deed (Chester et al., 2019, p. 13) and a sense of responsibility demonstration to rebuild community morale and motivation (Joakim and White, 2015, p. 202)."
3. Methodology: Is the paper's argument built on an appropriate base of theory, concepts, or other ideas? Has the research or equivalent intellectual work on which the paper is based been well designed? Are the methods employed appropriate?: Yes, several important arguments were based on some appropriate base of concept and principles such as
  1. "Rokib (2012) has the concept of distributing aid to the weak (du'afa) first. This is based on sura al-Maun."
  2. Islamic insurance services (Takaful) concept to mitigate disaster and financial risks, preparations such as sharia insurance are needed, namely takaful (Bousslama and Lahrichi, 2017)
  3. . Principles in Islam are a form of commitment to achieve a goal (mardhatillah), with this principle influencing actions to deal with disaster risks (Sun et al., 2018)
  4. There are three Islamic principles, namely belief (I'tiqadiyyah), worship to Allah (Ubudiyyah), and morality (Akhlaqiyyah)
4. Results: Are results presented clearly and analysed appropriately? Do the conclusions adequately tie together the other elements of the paper?: This final version has demonstrated a much more organised and clearer set of conclusions and adequately tie together the important elements.
5. Implications for research, practice and/or society: Does the paper identify clearly any implications for research, practice and/or society? Does the paper bridge the gap between theory and practice? How can the research be used in practice (economic and commercial impact), in teaching, to influence public policy, in research (contributing to the body of knowledge)? What is the impact upon society (influencing public attitudes, affecting quality of life)? Are these implications consistent with the findings and conclusions of the paper?: Very much. It has laid a strong concept of disaster management and planning from Islamic perspectives. The principles recommended in this paper have practical implications and can offer effective solutions especially for muslims who face natural disasters and other types of calamities. These implications are in tandem with the findings and conclusions of the paper.
6. Quality of Communication: Does the paper clearly express its case, measured against the technical language of the field and the expected knowledge of the journal's readership? Has attention been paid to the clarity of expression and readability, such as sentence structure, jargon use, acronyms, etc.: A much improved version compared to the previous ones.

Reviewer: 2

Recommendation: Minor Revision

**Comments:**

The paragraph used to introduce the presentation of findings is a better fit for the abstract than what is currently presented. In your abstract (findings) mention is made of behavioural prevention, reduction. It is not clear what this is in direct reference to as it is the only time reference is made to these terms in the article.

Be mindful to be consistent in the use of English words to help provide meaning to words that are unfamiliar to an English native. eg Principles of Crisis Management the word mardhatillah is used without the accompanying English term. You will lose your reader if this is not provided as the journal's audience includes primarily English readers. Another is sura al -Maun

**Referencing:** Table II does not have a reference

In your discussion Santana is mentioned but not sure it is a source as it is not included in the References

**Additional Questions:**

1. **Originality:** Does the paper contain new and significant information adequate to justify publication?: The paper brings insight and understanding to Muslim's approach and interpretation of crisis and disasters that could be a useful tool for crisis and disaster management practitioners

2. **Relationship to Literature:** Does the paper demonstrate an adequate understanding of the relevant literature in the field and cite an appropriate range of literature sources? Is any significant work ignored?: It does

3. **Methodology:** Is the paper's argument built on an appropriate base of theory, concepts, or other ideas? Has the research or equivalent intellectual work on which the paper is based been well designed? Are the methods employed appropriate?: Yes

4. **Results:** Are results presented clearly and analysed appropriately? Do the conclusions adequately tie together the other elements of the paper?: Figure 8 Needs a title to reflect what it is

The image which is the main centrepiece of the article does not clearly highlight to the reader which elements stem from your selective coding ie Religious Belief (which is renamed Principles of Crisis Management) Behavioural and Psychological response as this was part of the main finding. This could either be denoted by a symbol or colour coded with a legend explaining.

The word Islamic needs to precede the words Principles of Crisis Management at the bottom of the figure and also in the applicable heading under the section on Findings. The author(s) could possibly restate to say "Islamic Principles Applied to Crisis Management" as in fact they are not Principles of Crisis Management, but principles applied to the field. So this needs to be properly classified to reflect the selective coding heading or in the findings/discussion show how they connect.

5. **Implications for research, practice and/or society:** Does the paper identify clearly any implications for research, practice and/or society? Does the paper bridge the gap between theory and practice? How can the research be used in practice (economic and commercial impact), in teaching, to influence public policy, in research (contributing to the body of knowledge)? What is the impact upon society (influencing public attitudes, affecting quality of life)? Are these implications consistent with the findings and conclusions of the paper?: Demonstrates how the Muslim community has an embedded mechanism of support and community resilience to best respond to the members of their community. In influencing public policy, in countries that have high Muslim populations, leaders of their communities could be part of the response mechanism and could be included as stakeholders in the development of responses and recovery to crisis and disasters.

6. **Quality of Communication:** Does the paper clearly express its case, measured against the technical language of the field and the expected knowledge of the journal's readership? Has attention been paid to the clarity of expression and readability, such as sentence structure, jargon use, acronyms, etc.: The paper generally is clearly expressed - 70/100

Some grammatical errors are highlighted below

Grammar

Figure 5: Reliquity - Religion, Disaste r - Disaster

Figure 6: Reiligius - Religious

Figure 7: Prepadness - Preparedness

Heading: The Goal of Crisis and Disaster Manegement for Halal Tourism (Management)

Discussion - From the proposed framework, there are many Islamic teachings that shape the resistance of halal tourism by itself....Not certain if the word resistance here is used correctly. Can this be reworded

Research Implication and Limitation - Line 2 - new crisis and disaster management ? with the aim.... (a word is missing)

Conclusion: selecetd - Selected

To help support you on your publishing journey we have partnered with Editage, a leading global science communication platform, to offer expert editorial support including language editing and translation.

If your article has been rejected or revisions have been requested, you may benefit from Editage's services. For a full list of services, visit: [authorservices.emeraldpublishing.com/](https://authorservices.emeraldpublishing.com/)

Please note that there is no obligation to use Editage and using this service does not guarantee publication.