

# VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN THE CONTEXT OF INDONESIA

Ruslin





Ruslin, a PhD holder in educational studies, graduated from the University of Sussex, UK in 2017. He earned his second master degree (M.Sc) in Social Research Methods in education at the University of Sussex, UK in 2009. His research interests entail vocational education and training, professionalism in teaching, and English language learning and education.

---

This book discusses a number of issues related to the implementation of Vocational Education and Training (VET) which have been perpetual intense topics of discussion in different circumstances worldwide. The issues cover curriculum changes, quality of learning and teaching, relevance of VET programmes with labour market, revitalization of VET programmes, change of global labour market, revolution of skills, economic return of attending VET, and school and industry partnership. It also discusses benefits, challenges, and supports that students of VET might obtain from attending the OJT Programme held in industries under partnerships. It further contains the discussion about globalization, educational reforms, work skills changes and competence-based education curriculum with its learning by doing principle by revealing different lenses across the globe.

This book discusses the Indonesian education system and in particular vocational education system. It also discusses the core values of the Indonesian education system which are institutionalized in the five principles of the country (Pancasila) and the National Constitution (UUD 1945). The aim of the Indonesian education is essentially to intellectualize the people of Indonesia and develop them into completely qualified human beings who eventually gain high self-esteem on the basis of their consistent beliefs on one Supreme God. These are all packaged in the School-based Curriculum which is later substituted with the Curriculum-13 or so called K-13.



[www.elivapress.com](http://www.elivapress.com)

ISBN 978-99949-8-520-3



9 789994 985203

**VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN THE CONTEXT OF  
INDONESIA**

**By**

**Ruslin**

**Editors**

**Firdiansyah Alhabsyi**

**Hijrah Syam**

**2022**



## **Acknowledgement**

First and foremost, I would like to express my sincere thanks and gratitude to Allah SWT the Almighty God, who bestows intellect, knowledge, skills, opportunities and gifts that are very valuable, namely the true faith in ISLAM. This simple and concise book, which the author addresses to teachers and educational practitioners, can be completed in a timely and appropriate manner. All of this is a very great gift from Allah. Without His permission, blessings and grace, this book could not have been completed properly.

Blessings and greetings from the author are extended to the best human being created by Allah SWT, the leader of all the apostles, a role model for all mankind, the most beloved human being forever, Muhammad SAW. His total devotion and sacrifice for all mankind will never be equalled by anything else on this earth.

The author's thanks go to all co-workers at the Faculty of Education and Teacher Training UIN Datokarama Palu, Central Sulawesi Indonesia for their sincere support to the writer to become an academic. The writer also expresses his gratitude to all the academic community of UIN Datokarama, a place where the author continues to hone and develop his academic abilities. In this new workplace, the author gets a lot of inspiration for academic career development and learns from a number of talented academics. This space will never be enough to accommodate all the gratitude that is in the mind of the author to this great institution and everyone in it.

Special greetings and the author's sincere thanks go to his beloved wife, **Masnaini** for her endless and endless patience, sincere sacrifices, and sincere prayers while accompanying the author. In addition, the authors thank their beloved sons and daughters, sources of inspiration, foundation of all love, hope and affection, and as soul mates: **Rivaldi Fachrizam** and **Muhammad Alvi Darmawan, Nurul Muthmainnah, and Nurhasanah Salsabila** for their selfless patience, humming a sincere and sincere prayer in

the middle of a pitch-dark night, endless and edged prayers and all their sacrifices. The author's sincere prayer has always been a guide for them to achieve success in this world and the hereafter.

Above all, in particular the author would like to express his sincere and endless gratitude to his beloved parents **Hi. Tendri** and **Hj. Hannas**), mother and father who gave everything they had for the happiness of their children, brothers and sisters for the extraordinary moral and material support and endless prayers throughout the author's career journey up to the final seconds of writing this book. All of them, the author sincerely wishes them well.

Author,

**Ruslin**

## TABEL OF CONTENTS

	<b>The Title of the Book</b>	.....	I
	<b>Acknowledgement</b>	.....	li
	<b>Table of Contents</b>	.....	lv
<b>CHAPTER 1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	.....	1
<b>CHAPTER 2</b>	<b>Globalization, Educational Reforms and the Work Skills Changes</b>	.....	3
<b>CHAPTER 3</b>	<b>Vocational Education and Training</b>	.....	8
<b>CHAPTER 4</b>	<b>Competence-based Curriculum and Skills Development in VET</b>	.....	15
<b>CHAPTER 5</b>	<b>On the Job Training Programme in Vocational Education and Training</b>	.....	22
<b>CHAPTER 6</b>	<b>Indonesian Education System</b>	.....	35
<b>CHAPTER 7</b>	<b>School-based Curriculum and On the Job Training Programme</b>	.....	41
	<b>References</b>	.....	46
	<b>Biography of the Author</b>	.....	65

# CHAPTER 1

## Introduction

For many years, a great number of issues related to the implementation of Vocational Education and Training (VET) have been perpetual intense topics of discussion in different circumstances worldwide such as seminars, symposiums, and educational conferences as well as in educational researches. So far, the emerging issues have been triggered by dissatisfaction of educational stakeholders, practitioners and observers as well as users towards the implementation of VET. These issues are wide and diverse covering curriculum changes, quality of learning and teaching, relevance of VET programmes with labour market, revitalization of VET programmes, change of global labour market, revolution of skills, economic return of attending VET, and school and industry partnership. In addition, specific to Indonesian context and other developing and under developing countries, many more issues such as access to education, school facilities, quality of teachers, local government concerns, weak competitiveness of VET school leavers, and financial scheme may emerge and keep emerging along with implementation of VET now and then. The work of Taylor and Malcolm (2007) concerning with how learning can be expanded through high school apprenticeship is one of the current analyses related to one of the fore-mentioned issues. Hodgson and Spours (2006) drawing on the organization of 14-19 education and training in England questioned stability and sustainability of institutional approach in the light of financial, demographic, system performance and practical organizational pressures. They notified that having policy and practices changed coupled with policy steering mechanisms has resulted in weak collaborative organizational arrangements. The most current work of Gvaramadze (2010) highlighted the revolution of skills in the present day drawing a case on two developed countries which



geographically and culturally were entirely different, Denmark and South Korea. In Indonesian context, Chen (2009) raised questions in relation to market advantage of attending VET and academic achievement for further education afterwards. Many more studies and analyses will be specially presented in chapter three to highlight the current issues concerning VET. While many different studies and analyses referring to ever-growing issues along with implementation of VET, the key issue that will be highlighted in this study is the benefit of the school- decided On the Job Training (OJT) programme implemented in industry for students.

There is also a number of studies that address several questions related to benefit, challenges, and supports that students of VET might obtain from attending the OJT Programme held in industry. The aim of this study is to understand what learning benefits that students gain from the OJT programme from the accounts of students who enrolled in Business and Automotive studies. It examines three different areas: to identify list of main skills the students acquire, to understand how they acquire those skills, and to investigate whether there are differences the students have due to their genders, socio-economic background, and geographical setting (urban-rural schools). This study employs a case study approach to understand phenomena in relation to these issues in the selected VETs. To gain in-depth understandings of the phenomena, four different data collection techniques will be used to gather data from selected school stakeholders and mentors in industries.

## CHAPTER 2

### **Globalization, Educational Reforms and the Work Skills Changes**

A number of analysis and studies have been made to reveal the impacts of globalization on the VET development. One of the most influential works on this issue was done by Brown and Lauder (1999). In their analysis, the globalization has been claimed to have significantly transformed global education system. It has been further explicated that such transformations in the era of globalization have happened everywhere no matter whether the country is developed or developing by nature. To anticipate such global competition, Brown and Lauder (1999) suggested the importance of qualified education and training of a country. If this is true, this viewpoint has a strong implication on how to develop VET which enables to fulfil the global market demands in the present day. However, they warned that education does not have to subject to solely global market demands by side-lining social aspects of education: to educate for the well-being of the people.

In line with Brown and Lauder's perspectives, Taylor et al (1997); Tikly et al (2003); Keep (2002) and Ball (2008 reviewed in Wrigley, 2008) were some of the researchers who looked at how globalization affects current educational policies especially in relation to the VET development. Taylor et al (1997) and Tikly et al (2003) observing under developed countries: Papua New Guinea (PNG) and Rwanda and Tanzania identified that there were clear gaps in the process of decision making in those countries to either qualify skills for global competition or increase skills for eradicating poverty while submitting their educational policies to the donor's interest. In other words, there were dilemmas among decision makers in terms of priority due to external pressures. Meanwhile, spotlighting on educational policy in developed country like the UK, Keep and Ball (2008) found out that there is a

battle of interests among the decision makers over educational policy. Ball (2008) especially pointed out that the educational policy was solely directed to towards a competitive economy while sidelining the social values of education.

In the previous work of Pring (1995), it was notably shown that the pressures for educational reforms to take place was caused by growing dissatisfactions of the people such as employers, parents, politicians, and even students towards the role of education in bringing a good life for the people. Employers, for example, were notably dissatisfied of the result of education due to lack of basic skills required in industry provided at school (Pring, 1995). He exemplified that majority of industries and commercial worlds are not very keen on academic values as many people expected instead of value attached to personal development such as confidence, responsibility, readiness to learn, flexibility, cooperation, economic awareness, and entrepreneurship (Pring, 1995: 6). Although his comments might be right in some ways because the common ground is dissatisfaction of the people (employers, parents, politicians, and students) in general in relation to the role of education, it could be bias in a way that his analysis was addressed to a limited geographical phenomenon as well as cultural contexts.

Similar events are also sound in the East and South East Asian regions. Immediately after the worst economic crisis devastating this region in 1997, educational reforms took place (Kennedy and Lee, 2008). In responding to this, the countries across the East and South East Asian region such as Japan, Hongkong, Korea, Singapore, Vietnam, Malaysia, and Indonesia had made different educational reforms agendas and emphases. Kennedy and Lee (2008) noted that discrepancies in terms of capacities of the countries in this region were significantly ample making the reforms agendas diverse from country to country. Kennedy and Lee (2008) provided clear examples in the cases of Hongkong and Vietnam. As one of the most developed countries in this region, Hongkong put its educational reforms on three agendas;

curriculum, teaching, and assessment while emphasizing assessment for learning and 'no loser principle' in its educational programme (Education Commission, 2000 cited in Kennedy, 2008: 27). In contrast to Hongkong, Vietnam educational reforms has been relied on the so called 'the 10 Year Strategy' (Kennedy and Lee, 2008: 25) where a step by step agenda has been taken to move towards knowledge-base economy (World Bank, 2001a: 15 cited in Kennedy and Lee, 2008: 25). It is noticeable that both countries responded the fore-mentioned crisis in different ways since their educational preconditions are entirely different.

In relation to skills changes, Tabbron and Yang (1997) in their analysis emphasized on the investments of individuals, employers, and society for their skills development. This has been a prerequisite response to the changes of patterns of employments and skills need in society as a part of indirect impact of globalization. This has a strong implication on how the quality of VET should be shaped. Currently, Gvaramadze (2010) pointed out that in the era of information and technology; there is an increasing market demand in favour of highly-skilled workers. This has an implication on educational policy especially in VET policy needs to adjust their educational programme to meet the expectation of these days necessity.

Meanwhile, in the study of VET in relation to economic growth, Psacharapoulos, is a quite well-known figure in this particular issue. His study on 'VET Today: Challenges and Responses (1997) revealed the secrets of why VET has been long favoured to economic growth. He demonstrated that there were three characteristics (close to technological development; par excellence amenable to social engineering; and a possible policy to eradicate unemployment) making the VET being favoured in the eyes of the government. He argues, however, that VET could be strong panacea for many social ill.

Similar point of view was also revealed by Bennel and Segerstrom (1998) studying VET in the context of Singapore. They pointed out that VET

system was very flexible that enabled to meet new skills requirement rapidly because of partnership between government and industries closely built up. Psacharopoulos' view point in relation to government's favour of VET is basically weak and so are Bennel and Segerstrom's because a number of current research findings refute their conclusions. For example, Chen (2009) revealed that the economic return of the VET was not reasonably significant. Lewin (1993 cited in Tabbron and Yang, 1997) pointed out the VET programme was extremely expensive while the social benefits might not outweigh the costs. Also, there was a tendency that vocational graduate did not pursue their careers for which they had been trained. Both viewpoints (in favour of VET or otherwise) are weak since they both subject to condition and context where the studies were carried out. In addition, a great number of studies accused the failure of VET in meeting its ultimate mission, to prepare young people for job.

Unlike Lewin and Chen, Ziderman (1997) viewed that VET programmes would fail unless they remained relevant to changing labour market demands. To Ziderman, market demands should be a standpoint for the government to develop highly qualified VET in the present day. This viewpoint tends to be more inspiring to the government that is especially interested to develop a more accountable and relevant VET. The strength point of this viewpoint is to avoid judging 'black or white' to the implementation of VET.

From different point of views of researchers and commentators in relation to the work skills changes in this present day and the global market orientation, a number of inferences can be drawn. Firstly, a number of authors and commentators questioned the role of nation-states in relation to massive work skills changes due to global competition. The calls for the government to take actions for securing schools (especially Vocational Education and Training) for solely market-oriented are highly reasonable because the schools are established for educating youths to have a better

life. However, it turns to be a driving force for the countries to fulfil their short term political agendas.

Secondly, when the market orientation is the only goal of education, some norms of education was subject to the market requirement. Consequently, some particular groups of people especially those who are disadvantaged-group, marginalized, or working class will be excluded because they are not able to cover relatively high school fees. Casey (2004) and Gravamadze (2010) approved that the change of labour market had strongly influenced the orientation of schools.

Finally, the battle of influences, interests and political wills of the government and employers over educational policy has aggravated the implementation of VET as what Winch (2004:74) drawing on in the context of the UK vocational education and training argued that the government has had very little attention on preparing youths for a working life.

## CHAPTER 3

### **Vocational Education and Training**

This section consists of four parts: definitions and meanings of VET; the nature of learning in VET; competence-based curriculum and skill development; and debates on VET.

#### ***Vocational Education and Training: Definitions and Meanings***

UNESCO and the ILO (2001) define VET a study at an institution where technology and science are core subjects coupled with the acquisition of practical skills in which attitude, understanding and knowledge behaviour, communicative skills, team-work and other personal skills are primarily oriented for occupations. Meanwhile, the Australian National Training Authority (ANTA) (2004) describes VET as an institution that aims to provide skills and knowledge for work, enhances employability and assists learning throughout life. Bakri (1994) described VET as an educational institution where the primary orientation is to prepare students for job. The stressing point of Bakri's perspective relies on how VET plays its role in every possible way to provide students with opportunities to develop their best potential which later will be profitably valuable in the workplace. In DEPDIKNAS (2003) vocational education has been stated as a form of education aimed at developing students' maximum potential in order to be able to cope with a particular job in relation to their proficiency. Grubb (1985) described vocational education in relation to its role in preparing students with particular skills (skill culture) for immediate job by contrasting academic culture which leads to white collar jobs. He further elaborated vocational education in comparison with general education using specific terminologies such as

'hand' and 'mind'; 'practical' and 'abstract'; and 'vocational' and 'academic'. Vocational education is essentially an important measure for the development of the trained labour force required for the socio-economic development of a country (Kazmi, 2007).

In general, vocational education and training is expected to assist students to acquire relevant occupational and technical skills, prepare for future occupations, and make a successful transition from school to the world of work (Abdullahi, 1993). It is broadly service- and economic-oriented. In a sense, it is aimed at equipping learners with basic skills and supporting personal and social development (Newhouse and Suryadarma, 2009; UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2006). VET is inherently linked to the needs of business and industry (Cornford, 2006), and is expected to provide deliberate interventions to bring about learning which would make people more productive (or simply adequately productive) in selected areas of economic activity (Lauglo, 2007).

It is difficult to provide an obvious definition of vocational education and training (West, 1999) for two reasons. First, there are various types of VET. In terms of levels, it consists of secondary, post-secondary, drop-out and unemployment institutions. It is also focused on diverse sectors such as public services, engineering, IT, and agriculture. Second, VET is usually provided by different agencies ranging from government institutions to private training consultants (see Chappel, 2003). However, despite the variety of definitions given by different researchers and commentators, in practice VET is essentially job-oriented mode of education. In order to have a better understanding about what VET is about and how it plays a key role in the course of learning for society, it is worthwhile to look at the nature of learning that takes place in VET in general.



## ***The Nature of Learning in Vocational Education and Training***

This section is focused on the concept of general learning, learning by doing and learning as a process of becoming.

### **The concept of general learning**

In the eyes of psychologist, the concept of learning in general has been understood as a relatively permanent change of behaviour of a person due to activity of learning he or she takes (Atkinson et al, 1993 cited in Atherton, 2011). The implication is that a change of behaviour in a person could happen when there is an activity so called 'learning' taking place in his or her course of life. Pring (2005) states that people learn many things. It could be facts, concepts, principles, skills, attitudes, and competences. Due to different purposes that people have in mind in relation to the activity of learning, learning becomes multidimensional actions.

Meanwhile, Wenger (1998) states that the concept of learning in general is immediately understood and connected to images of classrooms, training sessions, the presence of teachers and learners, and the availability of teaching media and textbooks, homework and exercises. From this traditional perspective, learning is predominantly viewed as an activity taking place at school (in the classroom). Moreover, as Wenger (1998) argues, it is often associated with an activity which is limited to a particular place and time frame. In fact, learning can occur at any time and in any place in the course of our lives because it is a self-directed activity. In line with Wenger, Pring (1995) in relation to educative function of school described learning as to enable young people to learn what is valuable and significant. In his analysis, learning is described as what it *means* to learn and upon what is *important* to learn (p.137).

Although learning has different dimensions, essentially it has a common ground where it interplays one another. Pring (1995) commented that the

common ground can be identified through some changes in how one comes to see, understand, appreciate or feel after a course of learning.

### **Learning by doing**

The notion of learning in the context of vocational and education and training is somewhat different from what has been understood as learning in general. Colley et al (2003) identified what learning means in the prescribed curricula for the majority of VET courses. It is said that the emphasis of learning in VET primarily rests on the acquisition of skills (job-specific and transferable) underpinning knowledge to ensure their appropriate use in the workplace. In other words, the learning activity in VET is predominantly focused on how students are able to acquire knowledge and skills which enable them to do a job.

Similar view was presented by Schaap et al (2009) pointing that learning in the VET context is primarily based on a set of competencies wherein constructivist learning paradigm has been adopted. In this perspective, the development of students' personal professional knowledge is emphasized. This type of learning is primarily aimed at equipping students with technical skills for doing a particular job. In the work of Pring (1995), this learning type is described as learning how to do things. For example, a student of a business programme in VUSS is trained to develop his or her professional knowledge of how to reply to different types of official letters using word processing. This student can be categorized as competent if he or she is able to demonstrate how to reply to such different letters, without any guidance, in a prescribed time and with acceptable results. In this type of learning, an activity is mainly oriented to practical knowledge or is simply training for skills and training the hands for particular work (Schipper, 1994; Wakhinuddin, 2009).

## **Learning as a process of becoming**

General accounts of learning in VET emphasize the acquisition of technical skills and knowledge to foster behavioural competence in the workplace (Colley et al, 2003; Scippers, 1994; and Schaap et al, 2009). However, it is argued that such accounts fail to acknowledge the relationship between learning and identity. Drawing on their detailed case study of three vocational courses on childcare, healthcare and engineering in an English Further Education College within the Transforming Learning Culture (TLC), Colley et al (2003: 474) concluded that learning is a 'process of becoming'. In learning, no matter where and how it happens, there is a process of transforming cultures, values, traditions, norms and beliefs into the activity of learning. That type of learning is linked to the concept of *vocational habitus* (desired attitude and behaviour) is a central aspect of students' experience (Bourdieu, 1985). Bourdieu's theoretical point of view highlighted the activity of learning is a process of shaping or reshaping because of one's social background. For example, 'women on a childcare course were assumed to aspire to the *vocational habitus* because they were already pre-disposed to being carers as a result of their social background and early life experiences' (Colley et al, 2003, cited in Brockmann, 2010: 64).

Meanwhile, Lave (1988) views learning as a situated activity: that is, as it normally occurs, learning is embedded within activity, context and culture and usually unintentional rather than deliberate. He claims that learning is basically dependent on the context where it takes place. However, Schon (1983); Anderson, Reder and Simon (1996) argued that 'knowledge resulted from the activities of learning can be both partly context-dependent and partly context-independent' (cited in Schaap et al, 2009: 488). The context-dependent learning is called a process of 'legitimate peripheral participation' (Lave and Wenger, 1991).

Brown et al (1989) emphasize the idea of cognitive apprenticeship which supports learning in a domain by enabling students to acquire, develop

and use cognitive tools in an authentic domain activity. For example, in the course of cleaning a vehicle carburettor, before cleaning a student/trainee is usually given the theory consisting of procedures to follow. Based on the procedures, he or she is required to demonstrate his or her understanding of the procedures in a practical way. Learning in this type is shaped by practising more and more times. For this, Eraut (1994) and Wenger (1998) admitted that the quality of learning improves through practices.

Learning, both in the classroom and outside of classroom developed through collaborative social interaction and therefore knowledge is a product of social construction. Schaap et al (2009) found out that knowledge is shared and produced by collective norms, values, and beliefs in a professional domain. This type of learning can be related to the concept of personal professional theory (PPT) where declarative and procedural knowledge are developed through an interrelated process of internalization and socialization. From this perspective, social interaction and collaboration are essential components of learning.

Referring to different comments and analysis presented, learning activity in VET should be more practical and developed on the basis of students' personal needs and learning development stage. It can be primarily aimed at developing students' technical knowledge and skills but students' social maturity should also be carefully considered. By promoting this type of learning, students are expected to be able to develop their maximum and at the same time their identities are maintained. This is important because philosophically education should develop human into a good character wherein him or her there is a high skill coupled with highly acceptable manner potentially leading to prosperity and well-being (Winch, 2004). Similar opinion proposed by Lauglo (2009) suggesting that work productivity is not the only concern of VET. For him, learning to achieve a necessary skill required in industry is important but it is not adequate for coping with the rapid change of the global market. Social skill as a product of constant social interaction in the

community is the most important element of learning which eventually helps an individual to enter the world of work (Grigg, 1997).

To have a more comprehensive understanding about how course of learning has been so far designed in VET, it is imperative to look at into how competence-based curriculum as a major guideline largely used has laid its colour upon the implementation of VET in general.

## CHAPTER 4

### Competence-based Curriculum and Skills Development in VET

Schaap et al (2009) stated that vocational education is subject to constant social changes, technical developments, and organizational demands. Initially, vocational education and training was merely intended to prepare learners for a trade profession. Nowadays, the emphasis is moving forward to developing key action competences that are necessary for satisfactory occupational behaviour. In the current knowledge-based societies and labour markets, a professional not only needs specific technical and formal knowledge, but also needs well-developed professional skills and attitude for lifelong learning (Maes, 2004).

During the last thirty years, Mulder (2000) found that the issue of competence development has again been receiving a great deal of attention (see also Schaap et al, 2009; Biemans et al, 2004 and 2009). It was indicated by the increasing number of many organizations that used competences to manage change in their organizations. In the works of Achtenhagen and Grubb (2001); Billet (2000); de Bruijn (2004); Weigel, Mulder and Collins (2007), it can be identified that vocational education and training is one of the practical contexts wherein the concept of competencies plays a key role. For example, in the Netherlands, Germany, France, Great Britain and Australia competence based qualification structure has been adopted in VET.

Although competence-based curriculum has been world widely used, the meaning remains contested. Chappell (1996, cited in Kerka, 1998) found competence as a contested concept since the meaning can be shaped by those who use it. In a more traditional approach, McClelland (1976) and Boyatzis (1982) states that competency means detailed lists of fragmented and assessable behavioural elements related to job performance (cited from Biemans, 2009). However, Hager (1998) argued that competencies cannot be

specified precisely in the same way as performance outcomes can; and mistakenly equating learning outcomes (performance) and competencies gives the latter a false objectivity (cited in Biemans et al, 2009: 268).

While adopting philosophy of critical realism coupled with the sociology of Basil Barnstein, the work of Wheelahan (2009) showed the problem of competence-based curriculum in the context of Australian VET. In her analysis she pointed out the exclusion of working class students from pursuing powerful knowledge which they needed to participate in society's conversation and debates within their occupational field of practice in favour of 'authentic' learning in the workplace (Wheelahan, 2009: 227-228). If this is true, the majority of the VET curricula around the world can be regarded to cause failure to enormously large of potential students for pursuing knowledge according to their maximum potential.

Working on the opposite direction, Biemans et al (2009) highlighted that competence-based education and training (CBET) has welcomed a more self-directed, student-centred approach. Proponents of competence-based education promoted CBET as a way to improve the correspondence between education/training and workplace requirements, Harris et al (1995) explained. Supporting the argument of Harris et al, Kerka (1998) asserted that competence-based education is individualized, emphasizing outcomes (what individuals can know and do – learning by doing), and allows a flexible way of achieving the outcomes. This type of education promotes responsibility for learner's own learning and career path in which teachers are seen as coaches who guide students along their way (Biemans et al, 2008).

In the Netherlands, for example, a similar development is noticeable and coincides with the implementation of competence-based education in vocational education. In particular, schools for vocational education have started implementing competence-based education to better meet the demands of the labour market. In competence-based education the actual competences needed for working in *practice*, rather than in *academic*

*disciplines*, are the starting-point for curriculum development (Mittendorff, 2008; Biemans et al, 2009).

Although CBET has been proved to have credited to VET, Biemans et al, (2009) showed one of the pitfalls of competence-based education and training (CBET) is related to integrate learning at school and in the workplace. They argued that it is difficult to do so (see also Wesselink, De Jong and Biemans, under review), yet it is one of the most crucial characteristics of CBET (Wesselink et al, 2007). For its opponents, CBET is considered excessively reductionist, narrow, rigid, atomized, and theoretically, empirically, and pedagogically unsound (Chappel, 1996; Hyland, 1994, 2006; Boreham, 2002).

The major objection to the implementation of CBET is basically related to the conceptualization of competence in behavioural terms (Kerka, 1998) where competences are to be broken down into the performance of discrete tasks, identified by the functional analysis of work roles, adopting the behaviourist's framework. This type of framework is criticized for ignoring the connections between tasks, the attribute that underlies the performance such as the meaning, intention, or disposition to act; the context of the performance; and the effect of interpersonal and ethical aspects (Gonczi, 1997; Arguelles and Gonczi, 2000; Hyland, 1994). Studies of the development of skills and the constructivist view of learning suggest that people make judgments and review, reflect on, and change behaviour, continually reconstructing relevant and useful knowledge as they interact with a situation (Hodkinson and Issit, 1995; see also Lave and Wenger, 1991; Wenger, 1998). Radical constructivists (mainly represented by Ernst von Glasersfeld) suggest that knowledge is a social construct rather than a kind of copy of reality. They claim that knowledge is not passively received but actively built up by the cognizing subject (Riegler, 2003). More moderate constructivists suggest that learners should be aware that there is not only one truth but different, complex truths about the world. This calls for more



'open questions' (also in tests) that allow for different answers and a flexible application of what has been learned (ETF, 2009). This suggests that the function of cognition is adaptive; it serves the organization of the experiential world.

Another fundamental objection to CBET is the conception of '*skill*' and '*competence*' as being individual and *value-free*. This is contradicted by the constructivists' learning point of view which is that skills are social constructions or cultural practices (Harris, et al, 1995). In particular, the checklist approach in which competency is achieved or not achieved by a person is considered simplistic and demotivating, suggesting a '*minimum*' level of acceptable performance rather than a standard of excellence (Kerka, 1998).

Taking these criticisms into account, more comprehensive approaches of CBE have been developed (Biemans, et al, 2009: 268). The one now developed in the Netherlands and some European countries is focused on individual competence, based on the integration of different forms of knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as social and personal capabilities (Brockmann et al, 2008; see also Arguelles and Gonczi, 2000; Gonczi, 1997). The emphasis is not on a detailed list of underlying characteristics, but on the integration of knowledge, skills and attitudes which enable professionals to perform competently (Biemans, et al, 2009). In other words, the concept of competence tends to prevail over the more traditional notion of skills, as employers tend to put more emphasis on the overall competence of individuals – especially on their ability to communicate, to solve problems and to work in teams – rather than on their purely technical skills (Bertrand, 1998).

### ***Rational Choice on Vocational Education and Training***

In 2007, the Education International (EI) executive board adopted a set of guidelines for cross-border provision of VET. These guidelines were intended to address and counterbalance the threats posed by trade and

investment agreements on staff jobs and their living standards and the quality of education and training that students receive (EI, 2007a). Recently, the conference on Europe's progress and prospects for reforming VET in Thessaloniki, 2009 raised three points of discussion, that is, the plan to implement common European tools and principles that support life-long learning for all; the best way to promote excellence and innovation in VET; and the improvement link between VET and the labour market.

Based on Education International's (2009) analytical framework and Europe's progress and prospects for reforming VET (2009), the dispute over VET is focused on two aspects. First, the role of VET in social and economic development remains problematic. It has been identified that there are many controversies surrounding the policies of the World Bank, which has placed VET quite strongly in contrast with general education by promoting an agenda of privatization while reducing the availability of loans for the sector (EI, 2009). Despite this fact, VET is associated with high growth rates in economy in South East Asia as well as in industrialized countries. In Singapore, for example, the VET system was very flexible and capable of meeting new skills requirements rapidly and efficiently because cooperation was closely built up between government and industry (Bennel and Segerstrom, 1998). This was signalled by the effectiveness of innovative approaches like The Teaching Factory and Integrated Technology Learning Methodology to ensure high quality and completely relevant instruction.

In contrast, in the Indonesian context, two unconcluded arguments exist in relation to the role of vocational education. The first argument reveals that VET offers a lower-economist ratio. This illustrates that attending VET does not result in reasonable economic gain compared to the costs which have been spent during the school registration period. Second, according to the educationists' and sociologists' argument, attending VET tends to inhibit the students' potential attainment of a higher socio-economic achievement in the future (Chen, 2009).

The findings from Colombia, Tanzania, Kenya, Mexico, Jordan, Sri Lanka, India, Barbados, Swaziland, El Salvador, Brazil, Nigeria and Somalia, (Psacharopoulos, 1987 cited in Chen, 2009) confirm that the costs of vocational programmes are considerably higher than those of general education, while their benefits are comparable. The costs that individuals spent in vocational education and training so far did not profitably match with the return they gained afterwards. Consequently, vocational education and training was gradually abandoned because it does not significantly benefit students to find jobs as soon as they leave school.

A study conducted by Ziderman (1997) reveals that the role of VET programmes ultimately has failed unless they remain relevant to changing labour market needs. Besides, attention must also be paid to the need for greater efficacy and to non-economic aspects such as personal and career development of youth.

Second, in relation to the implementation of VET, the link between VET and the labour market is fervently debated. From the liberal educational perspective, the aim of VET is to provide individuals with skills to earn their living, thus supplying one of the conditions for economic prosperity (Winch, 2007; Brown and Lauder, 1999; Brown et al, 2001). If this claim is valid, then VET today is misguided. Winch (2007) claims that no one wants to work unless they have to. Although there is a great deal of criticism in relation to the market-based VET, it is unfair to justify that VETs in general are erroneous. The intrinsic importance of VET is claimed to be significant for preparing individuals with appropriate skills for earning their living (King, 2008). This is especially important since 'good quality skills are now increasingly seen as being critical to labour market productivity and competitiveness' (King, 2008: 3). The most important thing to be paid attention in the implementation of VET is the political interests of the policymakers (King, 2008).

For this reason, VET should not be undertaken for instrumental reasons but it should be prepared for something intrinsically valuable (Winch, 2007). It should not be purely a market tool. Instead, it should be an important public good in its own right (El, 2009). Vocational education needs to be closely linked to the requirements of business and industry both in terms of policy and educational practice, but not to dominate the VET policy as that leads to the exclusion of any other stakeholder interests (Cornford, 2006). Lauglo (2009) suggests that VET needs to be conducted according to general social norms about how learners and people in general are to be treated by institutions. Thus “*work productivity*” is not the only aim and concern of VET, as its distinctive objective is what sets it apart from other forms of education and training. The findings drawn from the two waves of family surveys in Indonesia, in 1997 and 2000, sadly demonstrate that attendance at vocational secondary schools results in neither market advantage nor disadvantage in terms of employment opportunities and/or earnings premium (Newhouse and Suryadarma, 2009).

Winch (2007) argues that if the mission of VET is to prepare students for work, it should ensure that the work is sufficiently remunerative to justify expenditure on it. This means that there should be a balanced return to both individual and employers. For the individual, discounted rewards should outweigh the costs spent on their education. For employers, on the other hand, VET should increase profits beyond what could be gained from untrained workers (Winch, 2007; Newhouse and Suryadarma, 2009).

## CHAPTER 5

### **On the Job Training Programme in Vocational Education and Training**

This section is focused on three parts: the integration between school-based and industrial-based learning in VET, definitions and purposes of OJT, and typology of OJT.

#### ***School-based and Industrial-based Learning in VET***

Countries in industrialized Europe all have different education systems which reflect their diverse political, economic and historical backgrounds. This also applies to South East Asian countries, including Indonesia. Reflecting on this, the structure, organization and content of vocational secondary education vary from country to country. Caillods (2004) commented that in spite of the differences, some common trends emerge as regards preparing young people for work. One of the implications of such policies in education is combining technical and vocational education with work experience through *apprenticeships* or *job placement* programmes (Caillods, 2004; see also Briseid and Caillods, 2004).

In France and Sweden, Caillods (2004) described that vocational education is offered in separate technical or vocational schools. There is a tendency to reduce the number of specializations and regroup students in broad areas of specializations. The students are also required to do job placements. In Australia, most vocational education and training is now incorporated into the National Quality Training System, which means that vocational education and training in schools (VETiS) is part of a system of vocational education and training, which is developed by and for industry (Dalton and Smith, 2004). This programme has provided students with opportunities to experience vocational studies while still enrolled in predominantly academic secondary school sequences of study. The students

are also afforded many opportunities to participate in structured work placements.

In Scotland and Ireland, vocational education and training is offered in comprehensive schools either full time or part time. Vocational courses are offered together with general and academic subjects for pupils who either want to move to higher education or have obtained a skilled worker's certificate. The German '*dual system*' offers a different form of vocational education. The apprenticeship model is developed where on the job practical training is provided by the firms, and students spend one or two days per week in school learning theory and basic subjects. In Indonesia, the OJT programme has developed in a different way from the original dual system of the German VET. It is developed at school level and later implemented in industry with a four to six month training period (Curriculum, 2006; Guidelines for on the Job Training, 2006). Some countries, like Norway, have developed a combination of the school-based (first two years) and the apprenticeship model (latter two years) (Briseid and Caillods, 2004; Atchoarena, 2004).

On the job training (OJT) programme in the VET is predominantly developed on the basis of market demand (Caillods, 2004; see also Unwin and Wellington, 2001; Schneider et al, 2005). A review of vocational secondary education in industrialized countries shows that the combination of school-based learning and industrial-based learning are emerging trends. The vocational education and training in Germany is guided not only by the requirements of the labour market, but also by the need for individuals to acquire skills, knowledge and competences that enable them successfully to prove themselves in the labour market (Schneider, 2005). It is believed that school is generally recognized as better suited to providing broad theoretical knowledge whereas industries or firms are better equipped for providing specialized and practical training (Caillods, 2004).

A study conducted by Schneider, Krause and Woll (2007) shows that in Germany, in 2004, approximately 53 % of the young people in one cohort

completed a course of vocational training in the dual system. Drawing on an ethnographic study of apprentices in retail and motor vehicle maintenance in England and Germany in terms of the construction of learning opportunities and learning cultures, Brockmann (2010) identified a sharp contrast between the two countries because of the tutor and the subject of class. In Germany, the occupation is one of high status and is renowned for the high theoretical content compared to England. This suggests that young people are greatly benefiting from the dual system of VET (where a strong apprenticeship system applies) allowing them to learn better and find better jobs (Caillods, 2004). However, the prestige traditionally enjoyed by apprenticeship under the *"dual system"* can be partly explained by the fact that it is the *"normal"* track, followed by a majority of young people, a situation which contrasts with that of most countries, where it is left to a minority resulting from a negative selection of less bright pupils (Bertrand, 1998).

Sudiyono (2000) found out that the dual system of education implemented in the VUSSs with on the job training was not focused on anticipating the needs of labour forces in the industrialized era, and this was manifested by the lower basic knowledge, technical skills, and communication ability of vocational school leavers. Muliati (2007) points out some weaknesses in the implementation of the OJT programme at VUSSs in terms of evaluation: no guidelines of assessment were provided by schools for industry to assess students' progress; no formal assessments were made; and grading for the students' achievements in the OJT programme was given in an open seminar. Likewise, a case study conducted by Susiana (2005) on the implementation of OJT at a wood furniture centre indicates that industry did not provide plentiful opportunities for students to work on more complicated woodwork, due to the distrust of the industry towards the students' achievements gained at school.

Working in the opposite direction, Nihayati (2008) identified that there was a strong correlation between the implementation of on the job training

and students' learning achievements. She claimed that if on the job training was well organized, students could improve their knowledge and technical skills.

As a work-related learning activity (Mills, 1993; Jacobs, 2003; DeSimone and Harris, 1998; Orsern, 2001), the OJT programme has been commonly understood as apprenticeships. In Indonesian, this regard has been even stronger since on the job training is related to a course of learning in which practices are highly emphasized. According to Lave and Wenger (1991) apprenticeship is learning to think, argue, act, and interact in increasingly knowledgeable ways with people who do something well, by doing it with them as legitimate, peripheral participants. It can be understood that both the OJT programme and apprenticeship are legitimate but peripheral participations. Both of these activities are the process of learning on the training site.

A work-related learning activity is basically a comprehensive range of learning where the main focus is on the world of work. Such work-related learning activities can be effective if the curriculum planning and the process of delivery have at least four elements: increasing students' understanding, awareness, and knowledge about economic and industrial trends, and the commercial and occupational world; assisting in developing students' skills; assisting in preparing students for eventual transition from school to work; and ensuring the quality of work-related activities, the relevance of the curriculum and the learning contexts (Mills, 1993).

### ***The Nature of On the Job Training***

Many researchers define on the job training (OJT) as a form of training that takes place at a trainee's regular workplace (Cho, 2009; Jacob, 2003; Sullivan, 2003; Sleight, 2003; see also Orsern, 2001; Rothwell and Kazanas, 1994; Mills, 1993; Wilson, et al, 1980; and King, 1964). From their perspectives, OJT is understood as a form of individualized training or self-



paced learning that allows a novice employee in need of training to receive the necessary knowledge, develop the required skills, and improve his or her performance on the job. It is further described as a process of explaining, demonstrating and providing structured supervision of specific skills or particular tasks.

Although researchers have similar perspectives in terms of deciding where such training takes place, the process of transferring and developing knowledge and required skills, and the goal of the training, they may differ in their way of looking at how OJT is conducted. Sleight (2003) and King (1964), for example, highlight OJT as a one-to-one, face-to-face kind of training on the job site, or so called *sit-by-me* training, which is similar to what Rothwell and Kazanas (1994) and Chasey (1997) term as *sit by Joe* training. This view implies that such training while on the job is primarily an informal activity where an experienced employee passes on his or her knowledge and particular work skills to a novice employee through the latter either observing or performing work in what Rothwell and Kazanas (1994) term '*job shadowing*'. Other researchers like Rothwell and Kazanas (1994) and Wilson et al (1980) make a clear distinction between unstructured and structured on the job training. In spite of this, they admit that many people perceive the OJT as more of an informal training.

The structured OJT essentially focuses on the acquisition of skills within the work environment generally under normal working conditions. Through on the job training, trainees are required to obtain both general skills that they can transfer from one job to another and specific skills that are unique to a particular job. On the job training typically includes verbal and written instruction, demonstration and observation, and hands-on practice and imitation. These instructions are developed on the basis of the objectives and competences derived from the curriculum. In addition, the process of on the job training involves one employee – usually a supervisor or an experienced

employee – passing knowledge and skills on to a novice employee (Rothwell and Kazanas, 1994).

In short, the objectives of the structured OJT are clearly outlined, the content is precisely described, training processes are intentional, and evaluation is based on performance on the job (Bjorkquist and Murphy 1996). This makes the structured OJT different from the unstructured training or job shadowing.

Regarding the various definitions given to OJT as a training programme, it is important to focus on the structured OJT (S-OJT) developed at VUSSs, which is the main concern of this part. Wilson et al (1980) and Swanson and Sawzin (1975) termed such a training S-OJT. There are three main characteristics that distinguish the unstructured and the structured OJT. First, the structured OJT uses a formalized system that breaks the training down into manageable units or chunks and provides consistency from shift to shift and day to day (Doss et al, 2007). Second, it has an identifiable plan designed to develop the worker's specific skills or level of competence and involves the active presence of an instructor or trainer during the training process (Wilson et al, 1980; see also Jacobs (2003, p. 28) and Cho, 2009). Finally, it uses a standardized work system that consists of well-written procedures, work instruction packages and job-aids to provide a road map for consistent training, and to sustain knowledge creation and learning.

### ***Typology of On the Job Training (OJT)***

The structured OJT consists of several general types of training, that is, *job instruction, job rotation, coaching, and mentoring*. In job instruction training, the trainer's role is that of an instructor. Being an instructor, the trainer primarily uses instructions in systematic skill training so that a trainee becomes practised in the process of training. After World War II, the traditional form of this training was abandoned. However, it has since moved away from its traditional form to a more formalized, well-planned and

organized kind of training (Orsern, 2001; see also Jacobs et al, 2003). There is a type of training where an employee is assigned to a different position or possibly to a different department at a particular time. This type of training is called job rotation. The assessment in this training is obtained from the accumulation of experiences of a trainee and this determines the trainee's final job assignment (Orsern, 2001; Sullivan, 1998).

Another type of OJT is coaching. In this type of training, the trainee must have a certain level of understanding of how to do the job. The trainer acts as a coach to facilitate learning and to guide learners rather than instruct or train them (Sullivan, 1998; Orsern, 2001). Mentoring is naturally quite similar to coaching, and is used where a high level of job knowledge or skill is required of the trainer. Thus, a mentor is usually a manager or supervisor rather than a co-worker as in job instruction (DeSimone and Harris, 1998).

Of the structured OJTs described in this section, it is reasonable to say that job instruction by its nature is much more similar to the OJT programme developed in the vocational secondary schools in Indonesia. The first reason is that job instruction is simple. It consists of four main instructions, preparing the trainee, presenting the operation, performing try-out work, and providing follow-up instruction. Having such a simple instruction enables students/trainees to get the job done easily. This simplicity is what makes the training distinguished from other types of training, which are more complex in nature (DeSimone and Harris, 1998).

Second, the training duration required in job instruction is short-term. Although the duration of the OJT programme is longer than job instruction, it is basically similar because both of them are short-term training. Third, the grading or assessment of job instruction is based on the ability of a trainee to demonstrate the job after the instruction. In the OJT programme, it is slightly different because the assessment of the students' progress is based on a combination of the ability of students to demonstrate the job on a daily basis

and the accumulation of the students' progress recorded in the journal of the instructor.

The way the job instruction is developed in a formalized, planned and organized training resembles the OJT programme. As a structured training, the job instruction is developed through written systematic planning. Although the process of training is carried out in an instructional way, the relationship between trainee and trainer is informal and relaxed since the trainer is basically a co-worker rather than a supervisor by nature.

### **Summary**

Referring to variety of literature reviews on VET presented in the previous sections, a number of arguments which are expected to shed light on this study can be drawn.

First, many researchers such as Brown and Lauder, 1999; Keep, 2002; Tikly et al, 2003; and Ball, 2008; Kennedy and Lee, 2008) examined how globalization has affected the construction of educational policy of a country and to what extent such generated educational policy fulfilled the real expectations of education in the country. This group seeks to understand complexities of global political, cultural as well as social interests surrounding educational policy process within which the VET policy has been so far constructed. Brown and Lauder (1999), for example, on examining the concept of economic development in developed countries in Europe and the USA highlighted the emerging transformation of global education system and stressed the need for qualified education and training. This work seems to be quite influential in this matter since more attention has been particularly given to the process of reconstruction of education system. A related work by Keep (2002) concerning with the influence of global market demands and cultural and social requirements leading to restructuring and revising education system and even abolishing the system is one of few similar works on this issue.

Second, the works of (Taylor et al, 1997; Tabbron and Yang, 1997; Bennell, 1999; Tikly et al, 2003; Hannah and Holmes, 2004; Ball, 2008; and Power and Frandji, 2010) gives more attention to preparation for skills for global competition. These contemporary works revealed how global market pressures take place in educational policy process. The works of Psacharopoulos (1997); Atchoarena (2004); and Hanushek and Wobmann (2008) revealed strong political interests of decision makers in the implementation of VET. Psacharopoulos (1997) putting the issue of social engineering embedded in VET pointed out a series of short term objectives of the government such as eradicating poverty, accelerating economic growth, and reducing unemployment. In essence, the works of researchers in this tributary is particularly interested to spotlight on how a particular power relation, interests, motivations, and understanding [political, cultural or sociological] influence the process of educational policy wherein compromises, negotiations, consensus have been made to achieve agreement.

Third, unlike the previous perspectives where the emphasis had been made on educational policy process within which VET policy was shaded, some contemporary researchers while observing emerging issues surrounding implementation VET highlighted significance of curriculum in driving VET to attain qualified outcomes. This part primarily emphasizes the significance of curriculum as a driving force for education. Amongst the researchers are Harris et al (1995); Chappel (1996); Kerka (1998); Mulder (2000); Wesselink (2007); Biemans et al (2008, 2009); and Mittendorff (2008). At this point, they rest their awareness on the importance of an ingrained curriculum while objecting competence-based curriculum which they regarded to cause subsequent failures in VET nowadays. Majority of this group strongly objected to the implementation of competence-based curriculum in relation to conceptualization of competence in behavioural terms pointing the fragmentation of competencies required for students to

achieve in discrete tasks. Despite this claim, some others proposed that competence-based curriculum is liable to maintain in the VET although it needs to be integrated with other skills to better meet current labour markets demands.

Fourth, this part highlighted the view points related to skill development. The proponent of this perspective underscores the roles of VET in relation to the evolution of skills. The work of Gravamadze (2010) in the context of low-skilled workers and adult vocational upgrading strategies in Denmark and South Korea revealed that the current change of work skills has been chiefly caused by the ever-increasing role of computer and other communication technologies. The current work of Kennedy and Lee (2008) on some Asian countries in relation to Educational Reform after 1997 financial crisis showed that the real problem for future growth in that region was not on institutional structure but gaps in human skills and technological capabilities. This has been linked to knowledge-rich production and innovation previously stated by Casey (2004). In the work of Tabbron and Yang (1997), the issue of the patterns of employment and skill needs in advanced countries had been particularly put forward by highlighting the urgency for individuals, employers, and society to invest in skills development.

Fifth, this part highlighted viewpoints in relation to apprenticeships [on the job training] developed in VET. The researchers in this stream seek to understand and explain the implementation of VET in relation to acquisition of skills for jobs while stressing the job training programme integrated with schools. The work of Caillods (2004) clearly showed the integration of VET and work experience through apprenticeships which has a close link to the theory of apprenticeship of Lave and Wenger (1991) and the more technical works of Mills (1993); Jacobs (2003); DeSimon and Harris (1998); Orsern (2001) and many more. In Australian context, a similar analysis has been made by Dalton and Smith (2004) in relation to the incorporation of most VETs into National Quality Training System developed by and for industry. In

favour of apprenticeship, a study of Schneider, Krause and Woll (2007) showed the excellence of dual system of German VET. This has been particularly supported by the comment of Bertrand (1998) on the implementation of dual system in German VET where he found majority of young people followed such apprenticeship as 'a normal track' in contrast to most of the countries in Europe left this to a minority group (less bright pupils).

Sixth part of this section highlights the works of social researchers in relation to modes of learning and training in VETs: school-based and industrial-based learning and trainings. VET has been understood as a stream of study wherein the acquisition of practical skills orienting to a particular job is chiefly emphasized. Vast ranges of issues have been addressed by different researchers in studying VET so far. Despite this, interconnectedness of each issue related to the modes of learning in VET makes this presentation lack of clarity. Therefore, this presentation is begun with the more theoretical work and ended up with the more technical ones. The position of VET can be traced back in the works of Grubb (1985), Abdullahi (1993), Bakri (1994) and the researchers under the group of UNESCO and ILO (2001). In relation to the mode of learning that takes place in majority of VETs, the theoretical work of Lave and Wenger (1991) has been primarily referred by many of current researchers on this issue. Similar works of Lave (1988); Brown et al (1989); (Schon, 1983 and Anderson et al, 1996 cited in Schaap et al, 2009) highlighted the mode of learning in relation to context where this activity took place. The issue of practice in the process of learning has been primarily stressed in the works of Eraut (1994) and Wenger (1998). The more technical work of Colley et al (2003), a detailed case study of three vocational courses on childcare, healthcare and engineering showed that learning was a process of becoming emphasizing the process of transformation of values. The most current work of Schaap et al (2009) on Students' personal professional theories in competence-based

VET and the previous work of Grigg (1997) put the issue of collaborative social interaction in learning pointing out knowledge as a sharing product of collective values, norms and beliefs in professional domain.

Seventh part of this section gives an emphasis to industrial-based learning and training [the on the job training] programme prepared at VUSS which will be the main focus of this study. In Indonesian context, a number of studies on the implementation of the school-based OJT programme have been conducted so far. The works of Sudiyono (2000); Susiana (2005); and Muliati (2007) put criticisms on the implementation of the OJT programme in industry while pointing diverse issues consecutively such as lack of focus of the OJT programme, distrust of industry towards students' prerequisite skill before the training programme, and unstandardized assessment used in the OJT programme. Nihayati (2008), having correlation study on the implementation of the school-based OJT programme and students' learning and training achievement found positive correlation between the two while suggesting the needs of a more well-organized OJT programme. In spite of vast ranges of issues have been addressed by different researchers in studying VET by far, and more particularly in Indonesian context, it seems that issue of how the elements of the on the job training is prepared at schools and its impacts on students' learning and training achievement has not yet been addressed as a research topic. Therefore, I am particularly concerned with these two units of analysis.

Finally, on the basis of the presented literature reviews and theoretical perspectives drawn from those literatures, this study will be particularly focused on two units of analysis: preparation of school-based OJT programme and its impacts on students' learning and training achievement (skill development). The first unit of analysis covers the preparation of the school-based OJT programme elements which consists of training objectives, training materials, and training assessment. The second unit of analysis deals with the impacts of the school-based OJT programme executed at VUSS



towards students' learning and training achievement. The investigation will be focused on how each of the elements in the school-based OJT programme is prepared and why it is all prepared as it is. The enquiry will also cover how and to what extents the school-based OJT programme affects students' learning training achievement.

## CHAPTER 6

### Indonesian Education System

Based on Law 20, 2003 (DEPDIKNAS, 2003), the Indonesian education system holds two educational dimensions: general State and Islamic education. Each of these elements is divided into four major categories: pre-school (kindergarten), basic education, upper secondary education, and higher education. Pre-school is an optional form of education given before the age of seven. Basic education consists of two levels of education; namely, primary and lower secondary schools. Upper secondary education is divided into two streams; that is, general and VUSSs. Like upper secondary education, higher education consists of two streams, general and vocational higher education. General higher education is divided into three stages: undergraduate or bachelors, masters, and doctoral degrees. Vocational higher education comprises diploma level one, two, three, and four; specialist one; and specialist two. Diploma four, specialist one, and specialist two are equal to bachelors, masters, and doctoral degrees consecutively (see Appendix 1).

The national education system consists of two main scopes; that is, track and level (UNESCO, 2009). In terms of track, Indonesian education consists of three categories: formal, non-formal and informal education. Both non-formal and informal educations are not specially described in this study. Formal education is divided into three different levels: basic education, secondary education, and higher education.

In terms of levels of education, Indonesia holds three major levels of formal education. The first level is called basic education. This is divided into two different parts within a total nine-year period of schooling. The first part is called primary education (Sekolah Dasar – SD) which is usually completed in six years, from year I until year VI. The second part of this basic education is

usually called lower secondary school (Sekolah Menengah Pertama – SMP). This level can normally be completed in three years, from year VII to year IX. The next level is called upper secondary education, and this level can also be completed in three years if it goes normally. This runs from year X to year XII. The third level of education, or tertiary education, is more popularly known as higher education. The higher education described here is undergraduate level (Bachelors). The normal completion of this level is four or up to four and half years.

### ***The Core Values of the Indonesian Education System***

The Indonesian education system is profoundly rooted in Indonesian core values, which are institutionalized in the five principles of the country (Pancasila) and the National Constitution (UUD 1945). According to the National Constitution, the aim of education is essentially to intellectualize the people of Indonesia and develop them into completely qualified human beings who eventually gain high self-esteem on the basis of their consistent beliefs on one Supreme God. The implication is that education is required to prepare individuals to be able to develop their maximum capabilities on the basis of democratic education. In this sense, schools are regarded as the most responsible institution for providing students with opportunities to attain knowledge as well as moral values according to their maximum potential without any discrimination due to their ethnicities, religions, social and economic background. This concern has been highlighted in the national development goal (GBHN – Garis – Garis Besar Haluan Negara) where the ultimate end of education in general is to increase the quality of lives of Indonesians. Essentially, education is expected to bring about a change in understanding, including how the physical and psychological health of the people can be improved afterwards, and ensure high quality personal characteristics in a fully self-controlled and responsible people (DEPDIKNAS, 2003).

The implementation of education in Indonesia is primarily based on the national education system, the Education Law 20, 2003 which is further elaborated in government policy (Law No 19, 2005). This government policy establishes the standard of the national education where autonomy of educational organization is regulated. It is initially aimed at accommodating different points of view in relation to the implementation of curricula at the basic level and in secondary education. According to this law, the local government is given responsibility to facilitate a broad educational programme and to increase the quality of education. Soedijarto (2008) noted that the local government has to provide a broad access to education as well as to create a room for improvement of the educational quality. Meanwhile, schools are given two responsibilities. First, school is expected to develop curricula and to organize a great variety of education operational aspects (including how to organize the OJT programme). Second, school is expected to initiate different networks such as school-industry partnership and at the same time to increase teachers' teaching quality for better educational services (Soedijarto, 2008). The government policy is further elaborated in the government policy (Law No. 22, 2006) where the content standards for basic and secondary education are specified (DEPDIKNAS, 2007).

Referring to the core values of Indonesian education, political commitments to achieve basic education for all (EFA) programme has been made in the last two decades. In terms of quantity, this programme has shown significant result. It has been estimated that nowadays approximately 96% of elementary school ages and around 70% or above of lower secondary school ages have had access to education (Soedijarto, 2008: 26). However, the quantity of the access to education did not go with the same line with its quality. Soedijarto (2008) further explained that poor quality of education in Indonesia was caused by several factors but the most influential factors of all were low provision and lack of facilities provided by the government. Although this is the fact, by far this has signalled the endeavour

of the government to develop a new vision of education as a part of the holistic reform in Indonesia. British Council (2009) states:

The new vision of Indonesian education emphasizes the implementation of the principles of democracy, autonomy, decentralization, and public accountability. The reforms in the educational system have given prominence to enhancing performance in the framework of equal opportunities in education. This reform process has had a fundamental impact on the national education system and its mission is to take on a great variety of challenges in the present day world (On line).

From the information above, it can be inferred that the government of Indonesia primarily aims at providing broad and equal opportunities to individuals to obtain education no matter where and how they live. Rural or urban citizens, disadvantaged or advantaged individuals, isolated and minority groups are strongly provided to have equal opportunities to access to education. However, in practice the opportunities to access to education have not yet been equally distributed.

### ***Secondary Education***

Indonesian Secondary Education according to the National Education System (Law 20, 2003) is rather complicated since Indonesia has two dimensions in its educational system; namely, General State and Islamic education. General State education is controlled by the government under the Ministry of National Education (DEPDIKNAS). Islamic education, on the other hand, is run by the Ministry of Religious Affairs (DEPAG). However, these two streams do not have significant differences in running their educational missions because both of them are primarily regulated according to the National Education System (DEPDIKNAS, 2003). For example, both General State and Islamic education share curricula for general subjects such as

Mathematics, English, Indonesian language, Science, and Civic Education. Despite this, it is the emphasis on Islamic education that makes Islamic Education different from its counterpart, General State Education. Islamic education highlights the Islamic core values with several religious-based subjects for students to learn and practise at school. However, General State Education does not put an emphasis on the Islamic core values because it is expected to absorb all Indonesians no matter what ethnicities they are and what sort of beliefs they have. Today, quite a few very traditional Islamic Educations, however, still maintain their local curricula and their school traditions and therefore the government is not able to intervene their educational programmes.

For upper secondary education, Indonesia holds two different streams. The first schooling stream is usually called general upper secondary school (Sekolah Menengah Atas – SMA). In this mode, academic propensity is primarily emphasized. Nevertheless some general secondary schools allocate particular time to develop students' vocational skills such as computer literacy, although the proportion is very limited and is not specifically ruled in the education system. In other words, this programme is purely based on the school policy. For example, some state schools nowadays provide opportunities for students to develop their word and excel processing skills.

The other stream is called Vocational Upper Secondary School (VUSS) or Vocational Education and Training (VET) as it is world-widely termed. This mode of schooling strongly emphasizes vocational and technical knowledge provisions. In the past, vocational education was well known through technical schools (Bakri, 1994), since it was concerned with technical work such as woodwork, metalwork and carving. In addition, there are very specialized vocational high schools that focus on aviation and shipbuilding (Newhouse and Suryadarma, 2009) but the number of these types are very limited and usually run in industrial regions or cities. However, generally,

business and management and technical sectors are the most popular of all. Along with the rapid growth of information and communication technologies nowadays, a number of technological-based fields emerged making VUSS programmes more diverse.

## **CHAPTER 7**

### **School-based Curriculum and On the Job Training Programme**

The current curriculum for vocational secondary schools (KTSP - DEPDIKNAS, 2007) is developed on the basis of six fundamental needs. First, the psychological development stage of the students is clearly emphasized. This implies that students' psychological learning stages should be carefully considered in the process of establishing learning objectives, competencies, learning materials and assessments because it is something to do with students' learning experiences, emotions, socio-economic background, and their social maturities. Second, the curriculum has been developed on the basis of the current work skills demand. This means that the current curriculum has been carefully adjusted to the demand of workplaces or industry where VUSS school leavers finally are aimed for. In other words, the curriculum of the vocational secondary school aims to provide students with particular technical skills as well as other skills such as social and communicative skills which enable them to enter the world of work as soon as they leave VUSS. Essentially, the vocational secondary school is aimed at preparing students to be skilful workers.

Third, the social environment is another aspect which has been highlighted in the development of the curriculum of the VUSS. This is based on the idea that students of vocational secondary schools are basically member of communities where they live and work later on. As a part of community, the students are required to be able to learn how to express themselves in and out of their workplaces. Therefore communication and collective skills as parts of social skills need to be included as skills to be learned in the curricula to ensure comprehensive skills gained by the students at VUSS which are subsequently necessary for them when entering workplaces.



The fourth need is the integration of the national development demand in the curriculum. Indonesia could potentially disintegrate as a nation due to discrepancies in educational provision in terms of financial supports, facilities, and human resources. Having a great number of islands with a large number of districts and townships and with various ethnic groups and languages may contribute to such discrepancies. For example, problems related to transportation are usually among the important factors that might slow down the distribution of learning and teaching facilities. Other distracting factors can be communication and information facilities. Therefore, to ensure national integration, the national curriculum has been set to provide equilibrium in the national development programmes.

The fifth consideration is that the curriculum is developed on the basis of science and technological advancement. The vocational school leavers should be prepared to encounter a wide range of technological development. For example, IT skills are now becoming compulsory for any vocational programme developed in VUSSs. Finally, the vocational secondary school curriculum is developed to prepare students to have a sense of the arts. Here, students are required to be able to appreciate art work of others and him. Having this, students are able to enjoy their learning (DEPDIKNAS, 2007).

The On the Job Training (OJT) programme in Indonesian VUSS is a particular training programme which has been in place since the vocational education and training was introduced for the first time (Bakri, 1994). This programme was later clearly devised and ruled in the 1994 curriculum. This school-decided training programme has been in practice since 1994 which was called the Dual System of Education (DSE) wherein *link* and *match* principle was first introduced (Andini, 2007).

As a consequence of the implementation of the Competence-based Curriculum (CBC) since 2000 which was further revised in the School-based

Curriculum 2006, the OJT programme specifically termed as Praktek Kerja Industri (PRAKERIN) or work practices in industry has undergone some principal changes. One of the fundamental changes in relation to the implementation of the OJT programme is the requirements for certification for student's vocational competencies from certified examiners of authorized industry. In the previous curriculum – the Curriculum 1994 and the Supplement Curriculum 1999 – certification for students' competencies as one of compulsory requirements for completing study in VUSS had not yet been introduced.

Another change of the OJT programme comes into practices so far is the duration of time (shifting from approximately three months training for the third year only in the previous curriculum to six months up to one year on job training in the current curriculum) and the possibility for VUSSs to send their students even in the first year of the registration period. The financial provision for the OJT programme remains the same where full participation of parents of students placed on the training is the only possible way so far.

The OJT programme is one of the compulsory programme of VUSS. It is a planned and an organized job placement experience which students must attend before completing their study in VUSS. This work-related learning programme is primarily planned and decided in VUSS in the form of on job training programme which is later implemented in industry.

The orientation of this programme is to provide students with opportunities to engage with the world of work. This training programme is expected to develop students' potential capabilities in relation to knowledge and technical skills that they have theoretically learned at school. The programme has been developed on the basis of Curriculum demand since Curriculum 1994 which was later on revised into Supplement Curriculum 1999 and again modified into a more competence-based Curriculum 2000 and 2004 and finally revised into Curriculum, 2006 (Anwar, 2003) where

VUSS is directed to prepare students to become prospective skilful workers in the future.

The OJT programme is a three- to six-month training programme developed at school and implemented in industry (DEPDIKNAS, 2007, 2005). This training programme is financially supported by parents of students to be sent to industry, and is preceded by several processes such as formulating objectives and competencies, developing training materials and training assessment instruments, and financial schemes. As soon as these processes have been decided, the memorandum of understanding between school and industry is made. The schedule of the OJT programme is made after all the processes have been completed.

The implementation of the OJT programme entails a one-week workshop preparation carried out at school immediately before the training in industry commences. The OJT begins with a one- or two-day induction. This type of induction is usually carried out by a large-scale company. However, the majority of industry does not provide such formal induction training due its facility shortage. The aim of induction is essentially to introduce students/trainees to what and how to start a training activity in industry although such information has been given beforehand at school. Afterwards, the training is carried out on the basis of working days. Some industries however allow students to work over times including weekends and holidays with some incentives. Although it is a rare case, it happens but with agreement of students.

The students' training progress is assessed by an instructor who is in charge, from the company involved, and is based on the learning and training objectives provided by the school. The assessment schedule is arranged by the instructor although this can also be negotiated with the teachers at school. In practice, responsibility to carry out assessment is openly given to the instructor or mentor. To record students' daily progress, a journal form is provided for both students and instructor. This is aimed at giving motivation to

students, especially to know their own progress. For the instructor, it will provide rich information about students' progress which is useful for his or her final assessments. Final assessment has been so far made on the basis of accumulation of students' learning progress from recorded journal of both student and mentor and also from day to day notes made by mentor according to observable skill progress of student. Finally, the OJT programme is completed with a final assessment. The accumulation of the students' progress during the training is graded and then certified. This certification shows whether students have failed or succeeded on the OJT programme.

## References

- Abdullahi, J. M. (1993) *Pre-service Skill Needs for Increasing Employability of Technical College Graduates*. Nsukka: University of Nigeria. Unpublished M.Sc. Thesis.
- Achtenhagen, F. and Grubb, N.W. (2001) Vocational and Occupational Education: Pedagogical Complexity, Institutional Diversity. In *Handbook of Research in Teaching*, V. Richardson (Ed.) pp. 604-639 Washington D.C.: AERA.
- Agrawal, A. and J.C. Ribot, 1999. Accountability in Decentralization: A Framework with South Asian and African Cases, *Journal of Developing Areas*. Vol. 33.
- Alam, S. (2008) *SMK, Jembatan Sekolah dan Dunia Kerja*. Jakarta: Yayasan Sukma. Available from: [http://mediaindonesia.com/index.php/sar\\_id](http://mediaindonesia.com/index.php/sar_id) May 16, 2009.
- Amirrachman, A., Syafi'i, S., and Welch, A. (2009) Decentralizing Indonesian Education: In *Decentralization, School-based Management, and Quality*. Netherlands: Springer. Vol. 8: pp 141-157.
- Anderson, L.W. and Burns, R.B. (1989) *Research in Classrooms: The Study of Teachers, Teaching, and Instruction*. Oxford, England: Pergamon Press.
- Andini, A.N. (2007) *Isu-isu Pendidikan*. Departemen Pendidikan Nasional RI. Available from: <http://one1thousand100education.wordpress.com/2008/02/07/pendidikan-kejuruan/> May 24, 2009
- Anwar, A. (2003) *Memahami Paradigma Baru Pendidikan Nasional dalam Undang-Undang SISDIKNAS*. Jakarta: POKSI VI FPG DPR RI. Available from: <http://wahyucp.blogspot.com/2008/08/paradigma-baru-pendidikan-nasional.html> May 13, 2009.
- Atchoarena, D. (2004) Exploring Vocational Education Reforms. *International Institute for Educational Planning*. Vol 22 (3) July – September 2004. Available from [www.unesco.org/iiep](http://www.unesco.org/iiep). April 13, 2009
- Atkinson R. L., Atkinson R C, Smith, E. E., and Bem, D. J. (1993) *Introduction To Psychology* (11th Ed) Fort Worth TX: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

- Australian National Training Authority (ANTA) (2004) VET — *What is it?*  
Available from: <http://www.anta.gov.au/vetWhat.asp>, Updated 22  
September 2004. May 13, 2009
- Arguelles, A. and Gonczi, A. (Eds.) (2000) *Competency-based Education and  
Training: A World Perspective*. Balderas, Mexico: Editorial Limusa  
S.A. de C.V. Grupo Noriega Editores.
- Arksey, H. and Knight, P. (1999) *Interviewing for Social Scientists*. London:  
Sage Publications Ltd.
- Bakri, M. (1994) The Development of Technical and Vocational Education in  
Indonesia: A Case Study in Quality Improvement. In *Case Studies on  
Technical and Vocational Education in Asia and Pacific*. Melbourne,  
Australia: Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology.
- Ball, S. (2007) *The Education Debate*. Policy Press. Book Review by Terry  
Wrigley, March 2008
- Becker, B., Dawson, P., Devine, K., Hannum, C., Hill, S., Leydens, J.,  
Matuskevich, D., Traver, C. and Palmquist, M. (2005). *Case Studies*.  
Writing@CSU. Colorado State University Department of English.  
Available from:  
<http://writing.colostate.edu/guides/research/casestudy/>. May 13, 2009.
- Bello, M.I., Danjuma, I.M. and Adamu, A.Y. (2007) A Survey of Vocational  
Training Needs of 15 – 25 Year Old Out-of-School Youths in Bauchi  
Metropolis. *Journal of Career and Technical Education*, Vol. 23, No. 1:  
p. 55.
- Bennel, P. and Segerstrom, J. (1998) Vocational Education and Training in  
Developing Countries: Has the World Bank Got it Right? *International  
Journal of Educational Development*. Vol. 18, No.4: pp. 271 – 287.
- Biemans, H., Wasselink, R., Gulikers, J., Schaafsma, S., Verstegen, J. and  
Mulder, M. (2009) Towards Competence-based VET: Dealing with the  
Pitfalls. Wageningen, Netherlands: Wageningen University and  
Research Centre.  
*Journal of Vocational Education and Training*. Vol. 61, No. 3: pp. 267  
– 286.
- Billet, S. (2000) Guided Learning at Work. *Journal of Workplace Learning*.  
Vol. 12: pp. 272 – 285.
- Blaxter, L., Hughes, C. and Tight, M. (2001) *How to Research*. Maidenhead,

Berkshire: Open University Press.

Boyle, H. (2006) *Opening Minds: Competency-based Curriculum for the Twenty First Century*. National Teacher Research Panel. Northamptonshire, UK.

BPS (2009) *Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Sulawesi Tengah*. Palu: BPS.  
[http://sulteng.bps.go.id/index.php?option=com\\_content&task=view&id=60&Itemid=42](http://sulteng.bps.go.id/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=60&Itemid=42) retrieved on April 15, 2009

Brahm, E. (2002) *Globalization, Modernity, and Their Discontents* 2002-3 CARTSS Series. Colorado: Colorado Edu. Retrieved from <http://faculty.unlv.edu/ericbrahm/globalizationreview.pdf> on June 1, 2010.

Breen, R. (1999) Beliefs, Rational Choice, and Bayesian Learning. *Rationality and Society*. Vol. 11: pp. 463 – 479.

Briggs, C.L. (1986) *Learning How to Ask: A Sociolinguistic Appraisal of the Role of the Interview in Social Science Research*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

British Council (2009) *Indonesia Market Introduction*. Available from <http://www.britishcouncil.org/eumd-information-background-indonesia.htm> May 12, 2009.

British Council (2009) *Education in Indonesia*. Available from: <http://www.britishcouncil.org/eumd-information-background-indonesia.htm> May 17, 2009.

Broadwell, M. (1986) *The supervisor and on-the-job training*.(3rd ed.). Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, Inc.

Brockmann, M. (2010) Identity and Apprenticeship: the Case of English Motor Vehicle Maintenance Apprentices. London: Westminster Business School.  
*Journal of Vocational Education and Training*. Vol. 62 (1) March, 2010, pp. 63 – 67.

Brown, J.S., Collins, A., and Duguid, S. (1989) Situated Cognition and the Culture of Learning. *Educational Researcher*, Vol.18, 1: pp.32 – 42.

Brown, P. and Lauder, H. (2001) *Capitalism and Social Progress: The Future of Society in a Global Economy*. Hampshire: Palgrave.

- Bryman, A. (2004) *Social Research Methods*. (2nd ed.). Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Bryman, A. (2008) *Social Research Methods*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Buchanan, J., Yu, S., Marginson, S. and Wheelahan, L. (2009) *Education, Work and Economic Renewal: An issues paper prepared for the Australian Education Union*. Sydney, University of Sydney: Workplace Research Centre.
- Bukit, M. (2003) *Arah Pendidikan Kejuruan*. Bandung: Pusat Pengembangan Penataran Guru Teknologi Bandung (PPP GT Bandung). Available from:  
[http://www.geocities.com/smkkorpri\\_duri/](http://www.geocities.com/smkkorpri_duri/) May 17, 2009.
- Carnoy, M. (1999) The Great Work Dilemma: Education, Employment, and Wages in the New Global Economy. In J. Ahier and G. Esland (Eds.), *Education, Training and the Future of Work I: Social, Political, and Economic Contexts of Policy Development*. London: Routledge.
- Chalmers, A. (1982). *What is this thing called science?* Queensland, Australia: University of Queensland.
- Chase, N. (1997) "OJT Doesn't Mean "Sit by Joe." *Quality*, November 1997, Vol. 84.  
 Available from:  
<http://www.referenceforbusiness.com/encyclopedia/Oli-Per/On-the-Job-Training.html#ixzz0fi1dFPIZ> February 12, 2009.
- Chen, D. (2009) Vocational Schooling, Labor Market Outcomes, and College Entry.  
*Policy Research Working Paper 4814*. World Bank: East Asia and Pacific Region. Available from: <http://www-wds.worldbank.org/> February 19, 2009.
- Cho D. (2009) *The Impact of Structured On-the-Job Training (S-OJT) on a Trainer's Organizational Commitment*. Education Research Institute, Seoul National University, Seoul, Korea.
- Christie, P. (1996) Globalization and the Curriculum: Proposal for the Integration of Education and Training in South Africa. *International Journal of Educational Development*. Vol. 16, No. 4: pp 407 – 416.



- Cielsik, M. and Simpson, D. (2009) Living with poor Basic Skills? The Role of 'Skills for Life' in Education-to-Work Transitions. In R. Brooks (Ed.), *Transition from Education to Work: New Perspectives from Europe and Beyond...*
- Cresswell, J.W. (2003) *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches*. (2nd ed.). London: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Cresswell, J.W. (2007) *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. (2nd ed.) California: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Crook, R.C. and Manor, J. (1998). *Democracy and Decentralisation in South Asia and West Africa*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., and Morrison, K. (2007) *Research Methods in Education*. London: Routledge.
- Colley, H., James, D., Tedder, M. and Diment, K. (2003) Learning as Becoming in Vocational Education and Training: Class, Gender and the Role of Vocational Habitus. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*. Vol. 55, No. 4: pp. 471 – 496.
- Collin, K. and Tinjala, P. (2003). Integrating Theory and Practice. Employees and Students' Experiences of Learning at Work. *Journal of Workplace Learning*. Vol. 15 (7-8): pp. 338 – 344.
- Cornford, I.R. (2006) *Australian VET Policy and the Role of Business and Industry*  
Adelaide, Australia: Faculty of Education, University of Technology Sydney. AARE Conference 26-30 November 2006.
- Cuddy, N. and Leney, T. (2005) Vocational education and training in the United Kingdom. *Cedefop Panorama Series*: 111. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 2005.
- D'Abate, C. P., Eddy, E. R. and Tannenbaum, S. I. (2003) What's in a name? A literature-based approach to understanding mentoring, coaching, and other constructs that describe developmental interactions. *Human Resource Development Review*, Vol. 2(4): pp.360 – 384.
- Dahama, O. P. (1979) *Extension and rural welfare*. New Delhi: Ram Parsad and Sons.

- Danim, S. (2005) *Menjadi Komunitas Pembelajar: Kepemimpinan Transformational dalam Komunitas Organisasi Pembelajaran*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Dash, N.K. (2005) *Module: Selection of the Research Paradigm and Methodology*. New Delhi, India: Indira Gandhi National Open University.
- de Bruijn, E. (2004) Changing Pedagogic and Didactic Approaches in Vocational Education in the Netherlands: from Institutional Interests to Ambitions of Students. *European Journal of Vocational Training*, Vol. 31: pp. 27 – 37
- Deci, E.L. (1992) The Relation of Interest to the Motivation of Behaviour: A Self-determination Theory Perspective. In K. A. Renninger, S. Hidi and A. Krapp (Eds.), *The Role of interest in learning and development*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- de Jong, J.A., Thijssen, J. G. L., and Versloot, B.M. ( 2001) Planned Training on the Job: A Typology. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*. Vol. 3, No. 4, November 2001: pp.405 – 407.
- Denzin, N.K. (1978) *The Research Act in Sociology*. London: Butterworths.
- Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (2000) *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. London: Sage Publications.
- Denzin, N.K.; Lincoln, N.S. (2005). Paradigms and perspectives in contention. In the *Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Denzin, N.K., Lincoln, Y.S. (Eds.). (2008) *Strategies of Qualitative Inquiry*. (3rd ed.). California: Sage Publication.
- DEPDIKNAS (2002) *Keputusan Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik Indonesia No. 044/U/2002 Tentang Dewan Pendidikan dan Komite Sekolah*. Jakarta. Available from: [http://www.mandikdasmen.depdiknas.go.id/docs/dok\\_10.pdf](http://www.mandikdasmen.depdiknas.go.id/docs/dok_10.pdf) April 22, 2009.
- DEPDIKNAS (2003) *Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia: Sistem Pendidikan Nasional UU No. 20 Tahun 2003*. Jakarta: Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional.

- DEPDIKNAS (2005). *Panduan Praktek Kerja Industri Luar Negeri (The Guidelines for On the Job Training Abroad)*. Jakarta: Dirjen Dikdasmen, Direktorat Pembinaan SMK.
- DEPDIKNAS (2007) *Naskah Akademik Kajian Kebijakan Kurikulum SMK*. Jakarta: Pusat Kurikulum Badan Penelitian dan Pengembangan.
- DEPDIKNAS (2009) *Data Pokok SMK*. Jakarta: Direktorat Pembinaan Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional <http://datapokok.ditpsmk.net/?aksi=4&prop=18> retrieved on April 2011
- DePorter, B. and Hernacki, M. (1992) *Quantum Learning: Unleashing the Genius in You*. In Alwiyah Abdurrahman (Trans.), *Quantum Learning: Membiasakan Belajar Nyaman dan Menyenangkan*.
- Descy, P. and Westphalen, S.A. (1998) '*Measuring the Effectiveness of Training*'. Working Paper, Cedefop.
- DeSimone, R. and Harris, D. (1998) *Human resource development*. (2nd ed). Fort Worth: Dryden Press.
- DEST (2006) *Assessment and Reporting of Employability Skills in Training Packages: Report to Department of Education, Science and Training*. Melbourne: The Allen Consulting Group Pty Ltd.
- Dey, I (1993) *Qualitative Data Analysis: A User-Friendly Guide for Social Scientists*. London: Routledge.
- DeWalt, K.M. and DeWalt, B.R. (2002) *Participant Observation: A Guide for Fieldworkers*. California, USA: Altamira Press.
- Doss, R., Linderman, K., Floss, G. and McGuire, R. (2007) *Structured On-the-Job Training and its Value to High Performance Manufacturing*
- Drever, E. (2003) *Using Semi-structured Interviews in Small-Scale Research: A Teacher's Guide*. Glasgow: the SCRE Centre, University of Glasgow.
- Dunne, M., Pryor, J. and Yates, P. (2005) *Becoming a Researcher: a Research Companion for the Social Sciences*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.
- Ellstrom, P. E. (2001). Integrating learning and work: Problems and prospects. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, Vol.12(4): pp.421– 436.

- Eraut, M. (1994) *Developing Professional Knowledge and Competence*. London: Routledge, Falmer.
- ETF (2009) *Teaching and Learning in Modern Vocational Education and Training Systems: the Importance of Key Competences*. European Training Foundation. Issue 02 September 2009.
- Fakhri, Z. (2007) *Pendidikan Kejuruan di Indonesia*. Jakarta.
- Flick, U. (2006) *An Introduction to Qualitative Research*. (3rd ed.). London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Flippo, E. B. (1961). *Principles of personnel management*. New York: McGraw Hill.
- Fox, S. (1997) From Management Education and Development to the Study of Management Learning. In J. Burgoyne, J. and M. Reynolds (Eds.) *Management Learning: Integrating Perspectives in Theory and Practice*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Galindo, S. (1999) *A revised on-the-job training system at Johnson Matthey Electronics*. Masters Thesis, University of Wisconsin-Stout, Menomonie, WI.
- Giddens, A. (1990) *Consequences of Modernity*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Global Education (2009). *Indonesia*  
Retrieved from  
<http://www.globaleducation.edna.edu.au/globaled/go/pid/645> on June 6, 2009.
- Gonczi, A. (1997) Future Direction for Vocational Education in Australian Secondary Schools. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Vocational Education Research*. Vol. 5 (1) May 1997: pp. 77 – 108.
- Grigg, J. (1997). *Portfolio Working: A Practical Guide to Thriving in the Changing Workplace*. London: Kogan Page Limited.
- Guba, E. and Lincoln, Y. (1982) Epistemological and Methodological Bases of Naturalistic Inquiry, *Education, Communication and Technology Journal*. Vol.30: pp. 233 – 252.

- Hannah, J. and Holmes, K. (2004) Social Transformation in South Africa: Mergers and College Governance. *International Institute for Educational Planning*. Vol. XXII, No. 3, July – September 2004: pp. 1 – 16
- Hanushek, E.A. and Wobmann (2008) Education and Economic Growth. *Chapter Prepared for the International Encyclopedia of Education* (3rd. ed.). California, USA: Hoover Institution, Stamford University.
- Harris, R. Guthrie, H., Hobart, B., and Lundberg, D. (1995) *Competence-based Education and Training: Between a Rock and Whirlpool*. South Melbourne: Macmillan Education Australia.
- Harvey, L., (2004–9) *Analytic Quality Glossary*, Quality Research International. Available from: <http://www.qualityresearchinternational.com/glossary/> February 4, 2009.
- Held, D., Mc Grew, A., Goldblatt, D., and Perraton, J. (1999) *Global Transformations*. Retrieved from <http://www.polity.co.uk/global/governing-globalization.asp#sample> on May 31, 2009.
- Held, D. (2000) Regulating Globalization? The Reinvention of Politics London: SAGE. *International Sociology*. June 2000 Vol. 15(2): pp. 394 – 408.
- Held, D. and McGrew, A.G. (2007) *Globalization/anti-globalization: beyond the great divide*. Cambridge, UK : Polity Press.
- Henn, M., Weinstein, M., and Foard, N. (2006) *A Short Introduction to Social Research*. London: Sage Publication.
- Hermanns, H. (2004) Interviewing as an Activity. In U. Flick, E.von Kardoff and I. Steinke (Eds.), *A Companion to Qualitative Research*. London: Sage Publications.
- Hippach-Schneider, U., Krause, M. and Woll, C. (2007) *Vocational Education and Training in Germany*. Cedefop Panorama series: 138. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 2007.

- Hodgson, A. and Spours, K. (2006) The Organisation Of 14-19 Education and Training in England: Beyond Weakly Collaborative Arrangements. *Journal of Education and Work*. Vol. 19, No. 4: Pp. 325 – 342.
- Holstein, J.A. and Gubrium, J.F. (2001) *Handbook of Interview Research: Context and Method*. California: Sage Publications.
- Hubbard, L.R (2009) *Are you professional?* Available from: <http://www.tipsforsuccess.org/professionalism.htm> May 17, 2009.
- Huberman, A.M. and Miles, M.B. (2002) *The Qualitative Researcher's Companion*. London: Sage Publications.
- Hyland, T. (1994) *Competence, Education, and NVQs: Dissenting Perspectives*. London: Cassell.
- Hyman, H.H., Cobb, W.J., Feldman, J.J., Hart, C.W. and Stember, C.H. (1954) *Interviewing in Social Research*. Chicago: The University of Chicago.
- ILO (1990) *Statistical Sources and Methods*. Geneva: ILO.
- Infokom (2005) *Sekilas Sulteng*. Available from: <http://infokom-sulteng.go.id/new/?p=22> April 12, 2009.
- Jacobs, R. L. (2003). *Structured on-the-job training: Unleashing employee expertise in the workplace* (2nd ed.). San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publications, Inc.
- Jaeger, M.M. (2007) Economic and Social Returns to Educational Choices: Extending the Utility Function. *Rationality and Society*, Sage Publications. Vol. 19 (4): pp. 451 – 483.
- Jazadi, I (2008) *Mencermati Perubahan Paradigma Pendidikan di Indonesia*. Available from: <http://iwanjazadi.wordpress.com/2008/11/11/mencermati-perubahan-paradigma-pendidikan-indonesia/> June 22, 2009.
- Kazmi, S.W. (2007) Vocational Education and Skills Development: A Case of Pakistan. *SAARC Journal of Human Resource Development* 2007.
- Keep, E. (2002) The English and Vocational Education and Training Policy Debate—Fragile ‘Technologies’ or Opening ‘Black Box’: Two

Competing Visions of Where We Go Next. *Journal of Education and Work*. Vol. 15, No. 4, Pp: 457 – 479.

- Kelly, L. (1994) *The ASTD Technical and Skills Training Handbook*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Kerka, S. (1998) *Competency-Based Education and Training: Myth and Realities*. The U.S. Department of Education. Contract No. ED-99-0013.
- King, K. (2008) *The Momentum Towards a UNESCO TVET Strategy'*. Nottingham, UK: A Background Paper for UNESCO. Available from: <http://recoup.educ.cam.ac.uk/news/tvetstrategyforunesco.pdf> June 23, 2009.
- King, D. (1964) *Training within the Organization*. London: Tavistock Publications.
- Klee, R. (1997) *Introduction to Philosophy of Science: Cutting Nature at its Seams*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Krauss, S. E. (2005) *Research Paradigms and Meaning Making: A Primer*. Selangor, D.E., Malaysia: Universiti Putra. *The Qualitative Report* Volume 10 Number 4: pp. 758 – 770. Available from: <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR10-4/krauss.pdf> May 18, 2009.
- Krueger, R.A. and Casey, M.A. (2000) *Focus Groups: A Practical Guide for Applied Research*. (3rd ed.). London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Kumar, K. (1995). *N. From Post-Industrial to Post-Modern Society: New Theories of the Contemporary World*. New Delhi: Blackwell Publishing.
- Kvale, S. (1996) *InterViews: An Introduction to Qualitative Research Interviewing*. London: Sage Publications.
- Lave, J. (1988) *Cognition and Practice: Mind, Mathematics, and Culture in Everyday Life*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Lave, J. and Wenger, E. (1998) *Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lauglo, J. (2009) *Revisiting the Vocational School Fallacy: A Tribute to Phillip Foster*. University of Oslo.

- Lauglo, J. (2009) *Research For TVET Policy Development*. Norrag Conference on Policy Transfer or Policy Learning : Interactions Between International and National Skills. Geneva, Switzerland. 25-26 June 2009.
- Laurier, E., Whyte, A. and Buckner, K. (2001), 'An ethnography of a cafe: informality, table arrangements and background noise', *Journal of Mundane Behaviour*. Vol.2, No. 2 Available from <http://mundanebehavior.org/issues/v2n2/laurier.htm>. June 12, 2009.
- LeCompte, M.D. and Goetz, J.P. (1982) Problems of Reliability and Validity in Ethnographic Research. *Review of Educational Research*. Vol. 52: pp. 31 – 60.
- Levine, C. (1996). Unraveling the five myths of OJT. *Technical and Skills Training*, Vol. 7, (3): pp.14 – 17.
- Lindlof, T.R. and Taylor, B. C. (2002). *Qualitative Communication Research Methods*. (2nd ed.) California: Sage Publications.
- Maes, M. (2004) *Vocational Education and Training in the Netherlands*. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Cedefop Panorama series: 96.
- Malone, V. M. (1984). In-service training and staff development. In B. E. Swanson (Ed.), *Agricultural extension: A reference manual*. Rome: FAO.
- Mason, J. (2002) *Qualitative Researching*. (2nd ed.) London: Sage Publications.
- May, T. (1998) Reflections and Reflexivity, In T. May and M. Williams (Eds.), *Knowing the Social World*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- May, T. (2002) *Qualitative Research in Action*. London: Sage Publications.
- McGrath, S (2007) Transnationals, Globalisation and Education and Training: Evidence from the South African Automotive Sector. University of Nottingham, UK. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, Vol. 59, No. 4, December 2007: pp. 575–589.
- Miami Edu (2000) *Collecting and Analyzing Interview Data*. Available from: [http://www.rsmas.miami.edu/IAI/Inst2000/lectures/wood\\_jul20/reading/](http://www.rsmas.miami.edu/IAI/Inst2000/lectures/wood_jul20/reading/)



qual\_appr\_2.pdf May 19, 2009.

- Michael, B. (2000) Theorising the Politics of Globalisation: A Critique of Held *et al.*'s "Transformationalism" *Journal of Economic and Social Research*. Vol. 4 (2): pp. 3 – 17. Retrieved from: <http://www.fatih.edu.tr/~jesr/Globalisation.pdf> on June 5, 2009.
- Minnesota State University, (2004) *Semi-structured Interview*. Available from: <http://www.mnsu.edu/emuseum/methods/semi-structured%20interview.html> June 27, 2009.
- Morgan, S.L. (2002) Modelling Preparatory Commitment and non-repeatable decisions: Information Processing, Preference Formation, and Educational Attainment. *Rational and Society*. Vol. 14: pp. 387 – 429.
- Morgan, S.L (2005) *On the Edge of Commitment: Educational Attainment and Race in the United States*. Stanford, C.A.: Stanford University Press.
- Morrow, R.A. and Torres, C.A (2000) The State, Globalization, and Educational Policy. In N. C. Burbules and C. A. Torres (Eds), *Globalization and Education: Critical Perspectives*. New York: Routledge.
- Mulder, M. (2000) *Competence Development – Some Background Thoughts*. Wageningen: University of Wageningen. Educational Studies.
- Muller, D. and Funnel, P. (1991) *Delivering Quality in Vocational Education*. London: Kogan Page.
- Muller, W. (2005) Education and Youth Integration into European Labour Markets. London: Sage Publications. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*, Vol.46 (5-6): pp. 461 – 485.
- Muliati, A. (2007) *Evaluation on Dual System of Education Program*. An Evaluation Research Based on Stake's Countenance Model on Dual System of Education Program at an SMK in South Sulawesi. Jakarta: Unpublished Dissertation.
- Myers, M.D. (1999) 'Investigating Information Systems with Ethnographic Research'. *Communications of the AIS*, Vol. 2, Article 23: pp. 1-20.
- Myers, M.D. and Avison, D. (Eds.) (2002) *Qualitative Research in Information Systems* London: Sage.

- Neitzschman, L.H. and Neitzschman, H.R. (2008) *The Semi-Structured Conversation*. [http://www.apdr.org/upload/Semi-Structured\\_Conversation.pdf](http://www.apdr.org/upload/Semi-Structured_Conversation.pdf)
- Newhouse, D. and Suryadarma, D. (2009) *The Value of Vocational Education: High School Type and Labor Market Outcomes in Indonesia*. *World Bank: Policy Research Working Paper 5035. East Asia and Pacific Region*. Available from: <http://www-wds.worldbank.org/>, 2009.
- Nihayati, S. (2008) *Pengaruh Implementasi Program Pendidikan Sistem Ganda (PSG) dan Motivasi Belajar terhadap Prestasi Belajar Siswa Kelas XI Program Keahlian Akuntansi SMK PGRI 2 Malang*. Jurusan Akuntansi, Program Studi Pendidikan Akuntansi, Fakultas Ekonomi, Universitas Negeri Malang : Skripsi.
- Nugent, J. (2008) *Signing of Loan Agreement for the Indonesia Vocational Education Strengthening Project*. Country Director, Indonesia Resident Mission Asian Development Bank. Jakarta: Indonesia.
- Osman-Gani, A. M., and Zidan, S. S. (2001). Cross-cultural Implications of Planned On-the-Job Training. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, Vol. 3(4): pp. 442 – 460.
- Orsern, N.A. (2001) *An On-The-Job Training System at Alias PCB Technologies: Establishing a Structured System of Operator Training*. Unpublished Masters Thesis. The Graduate College, University of Wisconsin-Stout.
- Palys, T. (2008) Purposive Sampling. In Lisa M. Given (Ed.) (2008). *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. Sage: Thousand Oaks, CA, Vol.2, pp.697-698.
- Phillips, D.C. and Burbules, N.C. (2000) *Postpositivism and Educational Research*. Lanham, N.Y: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Plummer, K. (2001) *Documents of Life 2: an Introduction to Critical Humanism*. London: Sage Publications.
- Powney, J. and Watts, M. (1987) *Interviewing in Educational Research*. London : Routledge.

- Pring, R.A. (1995) *Liberal Education and Vocational Preparation*. London: Hodder and Stoughton Educational.
- Psacharopoulos, G. (1997) Vocational Education and Training Today: Challenges and Responses. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*. Vol. 49, No. 3: pp. 385 – 393.
- Punch, K.F. (1998) *Introduction to Social Research: Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Purwanto, N. (2007) *Ilmu Pendidikan Teoretis dan Praktis*. Bandung: Rosda.
- Riegler, A. (2003) *The Key to Radical Constructivism*. Retrieved from: <http://www.univie.ac.at/constructivism/key.html> June 7, 2009.
- Republik Indonesia (2009) Antara – Angkatan Kerja Indonesia. Retrieved from [www.indonesia.go.id/id/index.php?option=com](http://www.indonesia.go.id/id/index.php?option=com) on June 07, 2009.
- Ritchie, J. and Spencer, L. (1994) Qualitative Data Analysis for Applied Policy Research. In A. Bryman (Ed.), *Analyzing Qualitative Data*. London: Routledge.
- Robertson, S., Novelli, M., Dale, R., Tikly, L., Dachi, H., and Alphonse, N. (2007) *Globalization, Education, and Development: Ideas, Actors, and Dynamics*. Bristol, University of Bristol: Department for International Development (DfID): Educational Papers.
- Rothwell, W. J. and Kazanas, H. C. (1992) *Mastering the Instructional Design Process, a Systematic Approach*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Rothwell, W. J. and Kazanas, H. C. (1994) *Improving on-the-job training: How to Establish and Operate a Comprehensive OJT Program*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Rubin, H.J. and Rubin, C.S. (2005) *Qualitative Interviewing: The Art of Hearing Data*. (2<sup>nd</sup> Ed.). California: Sage Publications.
- Schaap, H., de Bruijn, E., Van der Schaaf, M.F. and Kirschner, P.A. (2009) Students' Personal Professional Theories in Competence-based Vocational Education: the Construction of Personal Knowledge through Internalization and Socialization. Utrecht, the Netherlands:

Utrecht University, Open University of the Netherlands, and DL Heerlen. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*. Vol.61 (4) 2009, pp 481–494.

- Scholte, J.A. (2000). *Globalization: A Critical Introduction*. London: Palgrave.
- Sewell, M. (2009) *The Use of Qualitative Interviews in Evaluation*. Cyfernet Evaluation. Tucson: University of Arizona. Available from: <http://ag.arizona.edu/fcs/cyfernet/cyfar/Intervu5.htm> May 17, 2009.
- Sirozi, M. (2007) *Politik Pendidikan*. Jakarta: P.T. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Sisson, G. (2001) *Hands-On Training: A Simple and Effective Method for On-the-Job Training*. San Francisco: Berret-Koehler.
- Sleight, D.A. (1993) *A Developmental History of Training in the United States and Europe*. Michigan: Michigan State University. Available from: <https://www.msu.edu/~sleightd/trainhst.html> March 27, 2010.
- Soedijarto (2008) *Landasan dan Arah Pendidikan Nasional Kita*. Jakarta: P.T. Kompas Media Nusantara.
- Songgolangi (2008) *Sejarah Singkat Sulawesi Tengah*. Available from: <http://linosidiru.blog.friendster.com/2008/12/sejarah-singkat-sulawesi-tengah> April 12, 2009.
- Stromquist, N.P. and Monkman, K. (2000) Defining Globalization and its Implications on Knowledge and Education. In Nelly P. Stromquist, Karen Monkman (Eds), *Globalization and Education: Integration and Contestation Across Cultures*. Maryland, USA: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, Inc.
- Sudiyono (2000) *Educational Policy Implementation : A Case Study on Dual System Education (DSE) in SMK Teknologi Tunggal Cipta Manisrenggo, Klaten*. Brawijaya University, Malang: Unpublished thesis.
- Sullivan, R. (1998) *The transfer of skills training*. Alexandria, VA: American Society for Training and Development.
- Susiana S.A. (2005) *Model Pelaksanaan Pendidikan Sistem Ganda Pada Bidang Keahlian Teknik Bangunan SMK N 1 Magelang Tahun Ajaran 2004/2005..* Jurusan Teknik Sipil, Fakultas Teknik, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Semarang: Skripsi.

- Swanson, R. A. and Falkman, S. K. (1997). Training delivery problems and solutions: Identification of novice trainer problems and expert trainer solutions. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, Vol. 8(4), pp.305–314. doi:10.1002/hrdq.3920080406.
- Tabbron, G. and Yang, J. (1997) The Interaction between Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) and Economic Development in Advanced Countries. *International Journal of Educational Development*. Vol. 17, No. 3: pp. 323 – 324s.
- Taylor, A. and Malcolm, B.W. (2007) Expansive Learning through High School Apprenticeship. *Journal of education and Work*. No 20: Pp. 27 – 44
- Taylor, S., Rizvi, F., Lingard, B., and Henry, M. (1997) *Educational Policy and the Politics of Change*. London: Routledge.
- Tikly, L., Lowe, J., Crossley, M., Dachy, H., Garrett, R., and Mukabaranga, B. (2003) Globalization and Skills for Development: Some Lessons from sub-Saharan Africa. Bristol: University of Bristol. *Policy Futures in Education*. Volume 1, Number 2, 2003.
- UNESCO – UNEVOC (2006) *Participation in Formal Technical and Vocational Education and Training Programmes Worldwide: An Initial Statistical Study*. Bonn, Germany: UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre of TVET.
- Ute Hippach, S., Krause, M., and Woll, C. (2007) Vocational Education and Training in Germany. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 2007. *Panorama Series: 138*.
- van der Klink, M.R. and Streumer, J.N. (2006) The Effectiveness of OJT in the Context of HRD. In J.N. Streumer (Ed.). *Work-Related Learning*. pp. 369 – 392. Netherlands: Springer.
- Visser, M. and Kruss, G. (2009) Learnerships and Skills Development in South Africa: A Shift to Prioritise the Young Unemployed. Education, Science and Skills Development Research Programme, Human Sciences Research Council, South Africa. Routledge. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, Vol. 61, No. 3, September 2009: pp. 357 – 374.

- Ward, J. (2010) The JMA Analytics Model of VET Capability Development. *A Report on the National Survey of Vocational Education and Training (VET) Practitioner Skill*. October-November 2009.
- Weigel, T., Mulder, M., and Collins, K. (2007) The Concept of Competence in the Development of Vocational Education and Training in selected EU Member States. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, Vol. 59, pp. 53–66.
- Wenglinsky, H. (2002) How Schools Matter: the Link Between Teacher Classroom Practices and Student Academic Performance. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 10(12). Retrieved from: <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v10n12/>. January 7, 2009.
- Wenger, E. (1998) *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning, and Identity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Westgaard, O. (1993). Allow me to introduce...Frederick M. Taylor and the Gilbreths. *Performance Improvement Quarterly*, Vol. 6(1), pp. 86-90. Washington, D.C.: Learning Systems Institute, Florida State University, in cooperation with the National Society for Performance and Instruction.
- West, A. (1999) *Vocational Education and Training Indicators Project EU Priorities and Objectives related to VET*, November 1999. European Commission, Europe. Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (Cedefop).
- Wetherell, M., Taylor, S. and Yates, S.J. (2001) *Discourse Theory and Practice: A Reader*. London: Sage Publications.
- Wilkinson, D. and Birmingham, P. (2003) *Research Instruments: A Guide for Researchers*. London: Routledge, Falmer.
- Wilson, T.R., Olmstead, J.A., and Trexler, R.C. (1980) *On the Job training and social learning theory: A literature review*. Human Resources Research Organization. Alexandria: Virginia.
- Wilson, M. (1996). Asking Questions. In R. Sapsford and V. Jupp (Eds.), *Data Collection and Analysis*. London: The Open University.
- Winch, P. (2004) Education, Work And Social Capital: Towards a New Conception of Vocational Education. A Response to Richard Barrett.

*Journal of Studies in Philosophy and Education*. Vol. 23: 73 – 80.  
Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Winch, C. (2007) Vocational Education, Works and the Aims of Economic Activity. In L. Clarke and C. Winch, *Vocational Education: International Approaches, Developments and Systems*. Oxon, UK: Routledge.

World Bank (2009) *Indonesia at a Glance*. September 12, 2009.  
Retrieved from [http://devdata.worldbank.org/AAG/idn\\_aag.pdf](http://devdata.worldbank.org/AAG/idn_aag.pdf) on  
October 6, 2009.

Wunsch, J.S. (2001) Decentralization, Local Governance, and 'Recentralization' in Africa. *Public Administration Development*. 21: 277 – 288.

Yahampath, R. M. K. (2004) *A Study on Teachers Questioning in Mathematics Lessons in Primary Grades : A Case Study of a Selected Education Zone in Sri Lanka*. Sussex, University of Sussex: Unpublished Thesis.

Zideman, A. (1997) National Programme in Technical and Vocational Education: Economic and Education Relationships. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*. Vol. 49, No. 3: pp. 351 – 366.

Zuboff, S. (1984). *In the Age of the Smart Machine: The Future of Work and Power*. New York: Basic Books, Inc., Publishers.

----- (1998) *Vocational Education and Training System in Finland: Vocational Upper Secondary Education and Training*.  
Vocational\_education\_and training. Available from:  
[http://www.oph.fi/english/mobility/europass/finnish\\_education\\_system/voc](http://www.oph.fi/english/mobility/europass/finnish_education_system/voc) April 26, 2009.



**Ruslin, Ph.D** Diploma III (University of Tadulako Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia); B.Ed (University of Tadulako Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia); M.Ed (State University of Malang, Malang East Java, Indonesia); M.Sc (University of Sussex, Brighton East Sussex, UK); and Ph.D (University of Sussex, Brighton East Sussex, UK)

Place and Date of Birth	:	Palu, 15 February 1969
Address	:	BTN Palupi Permai Blok V2 No. 17, Palupi Kec. Tatanga, Palu Central Sulawesi Indonesia
Contact details	:	Mobile +62 85823552173
Email	:	<a href="mailto:radarmawan@gmail.com">radarmawan@gmail.com</a> or <a href="mailto:ruslin@iainpalu.ac.id">ruslin@iainpalu.ac.id</a>
Fields of interests	:	Professional Development and Professionalism in Teaching, Work-based Learning, Vocational Education and Training, Apprenticeship as a Way of Learning, Learning Experience, and Research on English Language Teaching



<b>EDUCATION</b>	
Sussex University, Brighton-East Sussex, UK PhD (S3) Educational Studies	2016 Awarded D.Phil. in 2017
Sussex University, Brighton-East Sussex, UK M.Sc (S2) Social Research Methods in Education	2009
State University of Malang, Malang-East Java, Indonesia M.Ed (S2) English Language Education	2003
University of Tadulako, Palu-Central Sulawesi, Indonesia B.Ed (S1) English Language Education	2000
University of Tadulako, Palu-Central Sulawesi, Indonesia Diploma (Diploma III) English Language Education	1991

<b>WORK EXPERIENCE</b>	
Lecturer – Undergraduate Program/S1 in English Language Study Program, State Institute for Islamic Studies (IAIN) Palu – Datokarama State Islamic University, Palu	2018 – Present
Lecturer – Undergraduate Program/S1 in English Language Education (Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris), University of Madako, Tolitoli Central Sulawesi	2016 – 2017
Lecturer – Undergraduate study program/S1 in the Faculty of Teachers Training and Education, University of Madako, Tolitoli	2004 – 2005
Lecturer – Undergraduate Program/S1 in Elementary School Teachers Education and Training (Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar), Open University, Palu Central Sulawesi Indonesia	2016 – 2017
Part-time Teacher – Al Quds Islamic and Arabic School, Brighton East Sussex, UK	2013 -2015
Part-time Teacher – SMAN 2 Palu, Indonesia	July 2007 – February 2008
Instructor – English language teaching workshop for Vocational high school teachers, Tolitoli Indonesia	2006
Instructor – School-based Contextual curriculum for English teachers of junior high school, Tolitoli Indonesia	2006

Full –Time Teacher – Junior High School (SMP Negeri 3 Tolitoli Utara), Tolitoli Indonesia	1997 – 2004
Full – Time Teacher – Junior High School (SMP Negeri 1 Lalos), Tolitoli Indonesia	March 1992 – July 1997
Part – Time Teacher – Senior High School (SMA Negeri 1 Dolo), Sigi Indonesia	1991 – 1992
Part – Time Teacher – Senior High School (SMA Nusantara Marawola), Sigi Indonesia	May 1990

## TAUGHT COURSES

1. Qualitative Research (Undergraduate – Bachelor Degree in English Language Education)
2. Research and Seminar on English Language Teaching (Undergraduate – Bachelor Degree in English Language Education)
3. Introduction to Research Methodology for Shariah Banking (Undergraduate – Bachelor Degree in Shariah Economic Banking, Datokarama State Islamic University – UINDK Palu)
4. English for Specific Purposes – ESP (Undergraduate – B.Ed Program, English Language Education, Datokarama State Islamic University – UINDK Palu)
5. English for Comparative Studies (Master Degree for Islamic Religious Education, State Institute for Islamic Studies, IAIN Palu)
6. Information System Management (Master Degree for Islamic Education Management, State Institute for Islamic Studies, IAIN Palu)
7. English Language I (Undergraduate – B.Ed. Program, Social Science Education Datokarama State Islamic University – UINDK Palu)
8. Introduction to Research Methodology (Undergraduate-B.Ed Program, State Institute for Islamic Studies - IAIN Palu)
9. Cross Culture Understanding (CCU) (Madako University Tolitoli Undergraduate-B.Ed Program)
10. Final Project (Open University Undergraduate B.Ed Program)
11. Action Research (Open University Undergraduate B.Ed. Study Program)

12. English for Elementary School Teacher (Open University Undergraduate B.Ed Program)
13. Action Research (Open University Undergraduate B.Ed Program)
14. English II (Non-English Undergraduate B.Ed Program)

## **AWARDS AND SCHOLARSHIPS**

1. Ministry of Communication, Information and Technology (MCIT) of the Republic of Indonesia 2008-2012: PhD in Education and M.Sc in Social Research Methods in Education (Sussex University, Brighton UK).
2. Asian Development Bank Scholarship 2001-2003: M.Ed in English Language and Education (State University of Malang, East Java, Indonesia).
3. Asian Development Bank Scholarship 1999-2000: B.Ed in English Language and Education (Tadulako University, Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia).

## **TEACHING, SEMINARS and TRAINING PROGRAM**

1. Workshop on Competence Development of Teachers on Classroom Action Research – CAR (Peningkatan Kemampuan Penelitian Tindakan Kelas), Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, May 2017
2. Training on Revitalization of the Tutorial Quality at the Open University (Diklat Revitalisasi Kualitas Tutorial Universitas Terbuka/UPBJJ Palu), Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, March 2017
3. Research and Seminar in International Education Development, University of Brighton, Brighton, UK 2013
4. Research Seminar and Educational Research Conference in Collaboration with the University of Manchester, Brighton, UK 2013

5. Research Seminar and Conference in Educational Research, University of Sussex, Brighton, UK 2012
6. Research Seminar and Conference in Contemporary Educational Research, In Collaboration between SPRU and University of Sussex, Brighton, UK 2012
7. IELTS Jakarta, Indonesia, 2008
8. IELTS Introduction and Simulation Session, Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia 2008
9. Institutional TOEFL, Tadulako University (Universitas Tadulako), Palu Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, 2007
10. IELTS Jakarta, Indonesia, 2007
11. IALF Jakarta, Indonesia, May 2007
12. Interview Test for the Ministry of Communication and Information of the Republic of Indonesia, Makassar, South Sulawesi, Indonesia, 2007
13. Vocational Teachers Assessors Training (Diklat Assessor Guru SMK) Cianjur, West Java, Indonesia, 2006
14. Cooperation as People's Economic Empowerment and Development Training (Diklat Koperasi Propinsi Sulawesi Tengah) Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, 2006
15. Mathematics, Physics, Chemistry, and English Learning and Teaching Strategies for Vocational High School Teachers (Diklat Strategi Pembelajaran MAFIKIBI) Cianjur, West Java, Indonesia, 2005
16. English Teachers Training at the Provincial Level (Diklat Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Inggris se Sulawesi Tengah di LPMP Palu), Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, 2005
17. Workshop on the Analysis of Vocational High School Potential (Analisis Kondisi SMK), Cianjur, West Java, Indonesia, 2005
18. In House Training on Life Skill Education, Tolitoli, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, 2005

19. In House Training on Vocational High School (SMK), Tolitoli, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, 2004
20. Training of Trainers (ToT) for the English Language Teaching, LPMP Palu, 2000
21. Training for Remote Area English Language Teachers, Palu, 1999
22. Training for English Language Tutors of The Paket B Educational Program, Tolitoli 1996
23. Training for Better Understanding of the Five Principles (Pancasila) of Indonesia, Palu, 1996
24. Training for English Language Teachers of The Open junior High School (SMP), Palu 1995

## RESEARCHES and PUBLICATIONS

1. ***Work-based Learning – WBL in Contemporary Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia.*** Research Article (in Progress)
2. ***How Main Skills are Learned in the Workplace?: Content and Pedagogical Reflection of School Stakeholders.*** Research Article (in Progress)
3. ***The Influence of Instructors on the Learning Experience of Students in the Workplace.*** Research article (In Progress)
4. ***Career Decision-Making Styles of the Undergraduate Students in Indonesian Islamic Higher Education.*** Research Article (In Progress)
5. ***The Internalization of Islamic Education Values in the Minority Muslim Community: A Case of Jembrana Bali.*** Research Article (Under Review)
6. ***The Urgent Needs for Effective Subject and Classroom -based Teachers Forums: A View on Teachers' Professionalism.*** Non research-based article (Under Review).

7. ***Global Job Market and the Urgent Needs for Effective VET in the Islamic Education.*** Non – research Article. (In Progress)
8. ***English as the First Chosen Foreign Language in Indonesian VET: Theoretical Perspectives.*** (In Progress).
9. ***Inconsistent Transition of VET School Leavers from School to Workplace: What things are needed?*** Non – research Article (In Progress).
10. ***Smartphone Culture: Shifting Ways of Students in Learning English at an EFL Classroom.*** IOSR Journal of Research & Method in Education (IOSR-JRME) .... December 2022 (In process of publication).
11. ***Contestation of Islam Nusantara: Reasoning of Pluralism in Constructing Religious Harmony in Indonesia Context.*** International Journal of Social Science And Human Research Vol.5. Issue 11, Pp. 5248 – 5256
12. ***Conceptualizing Learning Experience of Students in Indonesian Vocational Education and Training (VET).*** Proceeding of International Conference on Islamic and Interdisciplinary Studies, Vol. 1, Issue 1, Pp. 16-22.
13. ***An Overview About The Effects Of The Internet Use On Teenagers.*** Proceeding of International Conference on Islamic and Interdisciplinary Studies, Vol. 1, Issue 1, Pp. 417-421
14. ***How Does Vocational Upper Secondary School (VUSS) Influence The Learning Experience Of Students In Workplace?*** Proceeding of International Conference on Islamic and Interdisciplinary Studies, Vol. 1, Issue 1, Pp. 449-454.
15. ***Pendidikan Karakter Anak Usia Dini di Era Society 5.0.*** Prosiding Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Berbasis Multidisciplinary di Era Society 5.0. Vol.1, Issue 1, Pp. 94-98.

16. ***An Analysis of the Assessment of Learning and Development in Early Childhood Education.*** Prosiding Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Berbasis Multidisciplinary di Era Society 5.0. Vol.1, Issue 1, Pp. 51-56.
17. ***EMPIRICAL AND PRACTICAL ANALYSIS ON THE EXPERIENCE OF ENGLISH DEPARTMENT STUDENTS IN LEARNING SPEAKING SKILLS.*** Prosiding Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Berbasis Multidisciplinary di Era Society 5.0. Vol.1, Issue 1, Pp. 1-6.
18. ***Self-Reflection of EFL Teachers in Improving the Quality of Teaching Speaking Skills.*** Prosiding Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Berbasis Multidisciplinary di Era Society 5.0. Vol.1, Issue 1, Pp. 12-17.
19. ***A Neurolinguistic View of Language Development in the Context of Early Childhood Education.*** Prosiding Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Berbasis Multidisciplinary di Era Society 5.0. Vol.1, Issue 1, Pp. 7-11.
20. ***Pendidikan Karakter dalam Membentuk Nilai-Nilai Kepribadian Bangsa.*** Prosiding Kajian Islam dan Integrasi Ilmu di Era Society (KIIIES) 5.0. Vol.1, Issue 1, Pp. 7-11.
21. ***Insights about Reading Competences of Students in Public Schools in Central Sulawesi, Indonesia (IJRISS – July 2022)***
22. ***The Effect of English Song Lyrics on the Improvement of Students' Vocabulary Proficiency at the Eleventh Grade at SMA 4 Palu (National Conference UIN Datokarama Palu)***
23. ***Semi-structured Interview: A Methodological Reflection on the Development of a Qualitative Research Instrument in Educational Studies.*** IOSR Journal of Research & Method in Education (IOSR-JRME) 12 (1), 22-29 March 2022
24. ***Manajemen Konflik Dalam Organisasi Pendidikan Perspektif Stephen P. Robbins.*** Istiqra: Jurnal Hasil Penelitian 9 (1), 139-150 2021
25. ***Post Disaster Students' Mental Spirituality Development at Government Junior High Schools in Palu.*** INTERNATIONAL

26. ***Dynamic Discourse Approach to Classroom Research: Research Review.*** Pedagogia Vol.VII, No.1, Oktober 2019
27. ***The Teachers' Perspective about the Professional Certification of Teachers and its Influence on the Improvement of Students' Learning Achievement.*** IJCIED, Volume 1, No 1, Oktober 2019.
28. ***Critical Realism in Social Science Research: An Epistemological Perspective.*** SCOLAE Electronic Version Volume 2, Number 3, July 2019.
29. ***The Learning Experience of Automotive Students at a Vocational School in Indonesia: Perspectives of School Stakeholders.*** Unpublished Dissertation, University of Sussex, Brighton, East Sussex, UK 2017
30. ***The Learning Benefits of the On the Job Training (OJT) at a Vocational School in Indonesia: Perspectives of School Stakeholders.*** Unpublished Thesis leading to PhD in the School of Education and Social Work, University of Sussex, Brighton, East Sussex, UK, 2009
31. ***Qualitative Interview (Semi-structured Interview): A Methodological Reflection on the Development of a Research Instrument.*** This paper was presented on the internal seminar held at the School of Education of the University of Sussex, Brighton, East Sussex, UK, 2009.
32. ***Cooperative Learning in Reading Comprehension: An Action Research at MTs Sunan Kalidjogo, Malang,*** Unpublished Thesis at the State University of Malang, East Java, Indonesia, 2003
33. ***Increasing the Ability of the Second Year C of SLTP Negeri 2 Palu in Constructing Sentences Using Adjective Comparisons.*** Unpublished Final Project for B.Ed., University of Tadulako, Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, 2000





## BOOKS

1. ***A Simple Way of Doing Qualitative Research.*** (In Progress)
2. ***Menimba Ilmu di Negeri Ratu Elizabeth: Antara Impian dan Tantangan*** (In Progress)
3. ***English for the People of Da'wah Tableegh (Calling to Allah)*** (In Progress)
4. ***Dari D3 ke S3, Meretas Asa Menuju Singgasana: Refleksi Anak Tani, Guru, Pendidik, Pejuang dan Pembelajar.*** (In Progress)
5. ***Menjadi Guru Asyik Tapi Menantang: Dinamika Profesi Guru***
6. ***L'expérience d'apprentissage des étudiants d'un EFP secondaire en Indonésie: Point de vue des parties prenantes des écoles (French Edition).*** Editions Notre Savoir (26 Novembre 2020), ISBN-13: 978-6202598330
7. ***Die Lernerfahrung von Schülern einer weiterführenden Berufsbildung in Indonesien: Perspektive der Interessenvertreter der Schule (Versi Bahasa Jerman).*** Verlag Unser Wissen (2020), ISBN 978-620-2-59832-3
8. ***L'esperienza di apprendimento degli studenti di una formazione professionale secondaria in Indonesia: Prospettiva degli stakeholder della scuola (Italian Edition).*** Edizioni Sapienza (July 29, 2020), ISBN-13: 978-6202598361
9. ***De leerervaring van studenten van een secundair beroepsonderwijs en -opleiding in Indonesië: Perspectief van de belanghebbenden op school (Dutch Edition).*** Uitgeverij Onze Kennis (July 29, 2020). ISBN-13 : 978-6202598378
10. ***Doświadczenie w uczeniu się uczniów szkół średnich VET w Indonezji: Perspektywa zainteresowanych stron w szkole (Polish Edition)*** June 26, 2020. ISBN-13 : 978-6202598385

11. ***A experiência de aprendizagem dos estudantes de um ensino secundário na Indonésia: Perspectiva dos Stakeholders Escolares (Portuguese Edition)*** July 28, 2020. ISBN-13 : 978-6202598354
12. ***La experiencia de aprendizaje de los estudiantes de una escuela secundaria de formación profesional en Indonesia Perspectiva de los interesados en la escuela (Spanish Edition)***. June 26, 2020, ISBN-13: 978-620-2-59834-7
13. **Belajar, Praktek, dan Magang Versi Peserta Didik SMK: Integrasi Yang Belum Tuntas. Yayasan Barcode. ISBN: 786232850859 2020**
14. ***The Learning Experience of Students of a Secondary VET in Indonesia: Perspectives of School Stakeholders***. Lambert Academic Publishing Company. ISBN: 978-620-0-46553-5 2019

## **EXPERIENCES IN REVIEWING ARTICLES**

1. **Reviewer** in the International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science (IJRISS) since March 2022
2. **Senior Reviewer** in the International Academic Forum (IAFOR) since 2019

## **ORGANIZATIONS**

1. Deen Relief of Brighton, UK (Public Welfare Charity for Disabled Children Globally): South East Asian Appointed Representative 2018 – Present.
2. Deen Relief of Brighton, UK (Public Welfare Charity for Disabled Children Globally): Speaker 2013 – 2015.
3. ISOC (Islamic Society) Sussex University: South East Asian Representative Active Member 2008 – 2015
4. PPMI (Persatuan Pelajar dan Mahasiswa Indonesia, Brighton Branch): Co-initiators 2008 – 2015
5. BMC (Brighton Muslim Community): Active Member 2010 – 2015

6. Al Madeenah Islamic Center Brighton, UK: Appointed Part-time Imam 2014 – 2015
7. Al Quds Islamic Center Brighton, UK: Appointed Care-taker for the Congregation Prayers 2009 – 2015
8. Al Mu'min Islamic Center, Palu – Indonesia: Appointed Second in Charge Person 2008 – Present
9. Brighton Islamic Da'wah Team, Brighton UK: Appointed care-taker 2008 – 2015

## **ACHIEVEMENTS IN TEACHING**

1. **The Best 10 for the National Olympic of Senior High School English Teachers at the National Level** (Guru Bahasa Inggris 10 Terbaik Pada Olimpiade Guru Nasional Bahasa Inggris SMA/SMK Tingkat Nasional Tahun) Jakarta, Indonesia, 2016
2. **The Best for the National Olympic of Senior High School English Teachers at the Provincial Level** (Guru Bahasa Inggris Terbaik Peringkat Pertama pada Olimpiade Guru Nasional (Bahasa Inggris) SMA/SMK Tingkat Propinsi Sulawesi Tengah) Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, 2016
3. **Runner up for the Selection of the Best Senior High School Teachers at the Regency Level** (Guru Berprestasi Peringkat Ke 2 Pada Seleksi Guru Teladan Tingkat SMA/SMK) Tolitoli, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, 2006
4. **The Best for the Selection of the Best Senior High School Teachers at the Sub-district Level** (Guru Terbaik Peringkat Pertama Pada Seleksi Guru Teladan Tingkat SMA/SMK) Kecamatan Galang, Tolitoli, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia, **2006**

## **MANAGERIAL POSITIONS**

1. The Chairperson at the International Office of State Islamic University Datokarama Palu July 2022 – Now
2. The Head of English Language and Education Department, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education State Islamic University Datokarama Palu January 7, 2022 – Now
3. Secretary of Master Study Program in Islamic Education Management (UINDK Palu) 2021 – Present
4. Ad-Interim Secretary of Doctoral Study Program in Islamic Religious Education (IAIN Palu) 2019 – 2021
5. Deputy of the Head Master at SMK Negeri 1 Galang Tolitoli, 2006 – 2007.
6. Head of the Computer Study Program at SMK Negeri 1 Galang Tolitoli, 2005 – 2006.
7. Deputy of the Head Master at SMP Negeri 3 Tolitoli Utara, 1997 – 1999

## **MEMBERSHIPS**

1. Deen Relief Brighton, East Sussex, UK, 2013 – Present
2. Brighton Muslim Community, UK 2009 – 2015
3. Lifetime University of Sussex Alumni, UK
4. Research, Science and Innovation Society February 2022 – Now